



---

# Agenda

## Sustainability Task Force

A Committee of the Chico City Council

Meeting of Thursday, October 29, 2015 – 5:30 p.m.

Municipal Center - 421 Main Street, Conference Room No. 1 in the Council Chambers

---

1. **CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**
2. **APPROVE SEPTEMBER 10, 2015 MEETING MINUTES**  
*Draft 09/10/15 minutes attached.*
3. **STATUS OF STF 2015 WORK PLAN (Principal Planner Vieg)** – Discuss status of STF's 2015 Work Plan and future meeting topics. *Chair Stemen's 02/03/15 Memo to Council Re STF Efforts, and a Status Update of STF's 2015 Work Plan are attached.*
4. **UPDATE ON CIVICSPARK PROGRAM (Principal Planner Vieg)** – Provide STF update on City effort to participate in CivicSpark program.
5. **UPDATE REGARDING STF-SPONSORED SUSTAINABLE BUSINESS SERIES (STF Member Chastain)** – Provide STF update on 2015 Sustainable Business Series and plans for 2016 Sustainable Business Series.
6. **COMMUNITY CHOICE AGGREGATION CONCEPT (STF Member Chastain)** – Provide STF with update regarding Butte County's very early research on establishing a CCA. A CCA allows a community to manage purchases of electricity while using the local utility's infrastructure to transmit and distribute. The few CCAs in existence show costs of electricity anywhere from 4-10% lower than from utility provided electricity and are substantially reducing greenhouse gas emissions at the same time. There are two established CCAs in California – Sonoma Clean Power and Marin Clean Energy.
7. **BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR** - Members of the public may address the Task Force at this time on any matter not already listed on the agenda, with comments being limited to three minutes. The Task Force cannot take any action at this meeting on requests made under this section of the agenda.
8. **REPORTS & COMMUNICATIONS** - These items are provided for the Task Force's information. Although the Task Force may discuss the items, no action can be taken at the meeting. Should the Task Force determine that action is required, an item may be included on a subsequent agenda.

***Announcement Regarding BEC-sponsored Climate Rally in City Plaza on 12/12 @ 12pm***

9. **ADJOURNMENT** - Next meeting will be Thursday, December 10, 2015

**ATTACHMENTS:** Draft 09/10/15 STF Meeting Minutes  
Chair Stemen's 02/03/15 Memo to Council  
Status Update of STF's 2015 Work Plan

Agenda available from the City's website at [www.ci.chico.ca.us](http://www.ci.chico.ca.us) under "**Meetings/Agendas**"

Prepared: 10/23/15  
Posted: 10/23/15  
Prior to: 5:30 p.m.

Community Development Department  
421 Main Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, Chico, CA 95928  
(530) 879-6800



Please contact the City Clerk at 896-7250 should you require an agenda in an alternative format or if you need to request a disability-related modification or accommodation in order to participate in a meeting. This request should be received at least three working days prior to the meeting in order to accommodate your request.

---

### **Sustainability Task Force Members:**

Cheri Chastain  
Lucas RossMerz

Dave Donnan  
Mike Rubio, Vice Chair

Ryne Johnson  
Mark Stemen, Chair

William Loker

**CITY OF CHICO SUSTAINABILITY TASK FORCE  
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF  
September 10, 2015**

Municipal Center  
421 Main Street  
Council Chambers, Conference Rm. 1

STF Members Present:           Mark Stemen, Chair  
  Mike Rubio, Vice Chair (arrived late)  
  Cheri Chastain  
  Ryne Johnson  
  William Loker

STF Members Absent:           Dave Donnan  
  Lucas RossMerz

Staff Members Present:        Brendan Vieg, Principal Planner  
  Linda Herman, Recycling Coordinator

Guests Present:                 Mike Crump, Butte County, Director of Public Works  
  Steve Rodowick, Butte County, Recycling Coordinator  
  Kathryn Campau, Waste Management  
  8 Pleasant Valley High School students (AP Government course)

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Stemen called the meeting to order at 6:32 pm. STF members and City staff were present as noted.

**2. APPROVE JULY 23, 2015 MEETING MINUTES**

*The 07/23/15 minutes were approved (4-0, Donnan, Rubio, and RossMerz absent).*

**3. DISCUSSION REGARDING CURRENT AND FUTURE PLANS FOR RECYCLING AND REDUCING GHG EMISSIONS IN THE SOLID WASTE SECTOR**

City Recycling Coordinator Linda Herman provided a brief overview of the roles and responsibilities that the County, City of Chico, and local waste haulers play in waste pick-up and recycling, and implementing new state mandates regarding recycling.

Butte County's Director of Public Works Mike Crump and Recycling Coordinator Steve Rodowick led a discussion regarding the following topics: 1) use of metrics for assessing reductions of GHGs, 2) addressing the state's mandates regarding commercial recycling, 3) plans

to address state mandated organic waste reductions, and 4) the effect of state mandates on operational costs and cost to clients. **Attachment 1** provides an overview of the presentation.

There were a number of group discussions, including, but not limited to:

- The efficiency of methane capture at the Neal Road Land Fill, and how it relates to measuring GHG emission reductions
- Enforcement of mandatory State recycling requirements
- Ability to meet upcoming deadlines for State requirements for commercial recycling and organic waste reduction
- The inadequacy of local facilities to handle organic and other waste diversion
- Possible upgrades to the North State Rendering facility to handle increased organic waste

There was general agreement that a franchise agreement between the City of Chico and waste hauler(s) would address many of the unanswered questions regarding meeting state requirements, enforcement, reporting, and education.

STF Member Chastain invited County and City staff, as well as the waste hauler representatives, to participate in the STF-sponsored Sustainable Business Series in November that is focused on waste reduction and recycling.

*The STF requested that staff forward ICLEA's new Recycling and Composting Emissions Protocol.*

#### **4. UPDATE ON CIVICSPARK PROGRAM**

Principal Planner Vieg shared that at the direction of the STF he had applied to the CivicSpark program for a half-year member (approximately \$13,500) to implement a number of community engagement and education efforts identified in the City's Climate Action Plan. The response from CivicSpark was extremely positive, but in order to place a member in Chico, the program needs a full-year member commitment. At this point, Chico is on a waiting list for a CivicSpark member. Staff is coordinating with BEC (through the CA Ambassador Program), Butte County Community Development Department (to implement its CAP), and others to find additional financial resources to meet the year commitment. Vieg shared that he would continue to seek additional funding and coordinate with CivicSpark, and provide the STF with any relevant updates.

#### **5. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR**

The Pleasant Valley High School students shared that the Homecoming Float they are creating is being made with sustainable products.

#### **6. REPORTS & COMMUNICATIONS**

None.

7. **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business from the STF, the meeting adjourned at 7:00pm to the meeting of **Thursday, October 29, 2015.**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date Approved

Brendan Vieg, Principal Planner

Sustainability Task Force Meeting – September 10, 2015, 5:30 PM, Conference Room 1, City Council Chambers

1) Use of metrics for assessing reductions in GHGs

- a. County uses a consultant that is an expert in the field of GHG and landfills; Pat Sullivan of SCS Engineers who has over 25 years of experience in solid waste related issues and is an Approved Lead Verifier from the California Air Resource Boards, AB 32 Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Program.
- b. SCS uses volume of landfill gas captured in the landfill's gas collection system, measurements from soil gas probes located on the landfill, monitoring of surface for emissions (gas detection analyzer 3 inches off ground walked at 25 ft grid pattern, all geomembrane penetrations and gas piping connections) and compares to decay models to project methane generation and capture. **No exceedances of EPA surface emissions thresholds detected since gas collection system started operating in 2006.**
- c. Gas collection system efficiency is a function of design and construction materials used. In our case the closed section of the landfill is sealed with 1 foot of compacted clay with a 40 mil Geomembrane cover overlain. All well penetrations are sealed, so the cover is essentially air tight. Outside the immediate operations area, active cells are covered with 12 – 18 inches of soil with heavy plastic sheeting installed over the top. The EPA standard is 6 inches of soil with no plastic covering. So, our collection system is much more efficient than the default design. All areas with trash have gas collection systems installed. **EPA standard is waste that is 5 yrs old or greater, our standard is 2 years, so we capture gas much earlier.**

2) Addressing Mandatory Commercial Recycling

- a. The County previously implemented Mandatory Commercial Recycling by ordinance and earlier this year incorporated this into our franchise agreements.
- b. All permitted haulers are required to report to the county compliance levels and outreach efforts for those qualifying accounts not in compliance.

Attachment 1

## Sustainability Task Force Meeting

### 3) Plans to address state mandated organic waste reduction

- a. The County is well suited to comply with Mandatory Organic Waste Recycling (AB1826)
  - i. Franchise agreements with haulers provides the structure for collection programs
  - ii. Ample capacity for green and wood waste processing at 3 local compost facilities
  - iii. Butte County's North State Rendering has the only anaerobic digestion facility permitted to accept and process food waste in the north state (Recology's compost facility in Marysville is also permitted). North State Rendering is expanding its existing infrastructure to accept food waste from the company's multi-county service area to increase feedstock for its AD units. North State Rendering's infrastructure has the capability of generating electricity and transportation fuel.

### 4) The effect of state mandates on operational costs and costs to clients

- a. No getting around it, state mandates add costs
  - i. Collection costs, infrastructure costs, administrative costs for additional tracking and reporting
  - ii. County starting to assess these costs
- b. However, the County already has good compost facilities for green waste and a local, currently permitted food waste receiving facility to meet requirements of AB1826. Determining the costs associated with existing facilities should be relatively straight forward.

***We have good programs, great participation, a great record of achieving state mandated diversion, and there is no valid reason to suggest we won't in the future.***



# Mandatory Commercial Organics Recycling

## AB 1826

New State laws mandate that after January 1, 2016, local jurisdictions across the state implement an organic waste recycling program to divert organic waste generated by businesses. The law phases in the requirements on businesses, including multifamily residential dwellings that consist of five or more units, over time based on the amount and type of organic waste the business produces on a weekly basis. Full implementation will be realized in 2019. The implementation schedule is as follows:

- **January 1, 2016:** Local jurisdictions shall have an **ORGANIC WASTE RECYCLING PLAN** in place. Jurisdictions shall conduct outreach, education to inform businesses how to recycle organic waste in the jurisdiction, and monitoring to identify those not recycling and inform them of the law and how to recycle organic waste.
- **April 1, 2016:** Businesses that generate eight cubic yards of organic waste per week shall arrange for organic waste recycling services. Jurisdiction needs to have ordinance or franchise agreement to require haulers to provide organic waste recycling service to commercial customers meeting threshold.
- **January 1, 2017:** Businesses that generate four cubic yards of organic waste per week shall arrange for organic waste recycling services.
- **August 1, 2017 and ongoing:** Jurisdictions shall provide information about their organic waste recycling program implementation in the annual report submitted to CalRecycle.
- **January 1, 2019:** Businesses that generate four cubic yards or more of commercial solid waste per week shall arrange for organic waste recycling services.

### What action has the County taken?

The County has met with stakeholders (private and local government) to update them on the requirements.

County is working with franchised haulers to identify customers meeting the first tier threshold. Once these customers are identified, we will have much more information available to develop our plan. Each jurisdiction should be doing something similar.

County is working with local facility operators and haulers to facilitate development of facilities needed to be able to process food waste and co-collected food/green waste. There is only one permitted facility in Butte County that can accept food waste for processing: North State Rendering (NSR). The County is assisting with NSR with a Greenhouse Gas Reduction Grant application that will allow NSR to expand its food waste receiving capabilities. If successful in receiving the grant, NSR should be able to receive all food waste for the Tier 1 threshold commercial customers next year.

County is also working with franchised haulers to develop and/or expand composting facilities in the county that will allow these facilities to receive co-collected food/green waste. Co-collection is much more cost efficient and will be the preferred choice of the haulers.



# CITY OF CHICO MEMORANDUM

TO: City Council  
DATE: February 3, 2015

FROM: Mark Stemen, STF Chair  
FILE: STF File

SUBJECT: Sustainability Task Force Update

---

In November 2012, the City Council adopted a Climate Action Plan (CAP), which identifies actions to be taken by the City and the community to reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions to 25% below 2005 levels by 2020. The City's goal is consistent with State and Federal efforts to reduce emissions of greenhouse gases linked to climate change. In November 2013, Council appointed a seven member Sustainability Task Force (STF) to function as a "working committee" to lead the City's implementation of the CAP, and directed staff to work with the ad hoc committee as needed.

The CAP is broken up into Phase I and Phase 2 actions. Phase I actions are to be implemented prior to 2015 and are projected to reduce GHG emissions to 10% below 2005 levels, with the remaining 15% of the 25% goal to be achieved in Phase 2 between the years 2016 and 2020. Many of the CAP's Phase I actions have already been implemented, are underway, or are ongoing.

The STF has been meeting regularly over the past year at both the full committee and sub-committee level to review the status of implementation of CAP and to prioritize actions for possible future consideration by the City Council.

## **2014 Accomplishments**

The STF met seven times from December 2013 through 2014. Below are key accomplishments:

- Received Brown Act, conflict of interest, and ethics training, and elected Chair and Vice-Chair.
- Developed ad hoc sub-committees, including Energy, Transportation, and Solid Waste, which then met to review status of Phase I CAP actions and provide updates to the full STF.
- Provided letter to Council regarding importance of including CAP concepts and actions into Solid Waste Franchise Agreement.
- Participated in a joint meeting with the Planning Commission and provided comments on the City's Sustainability Indicators Report.
- Comprehensively reviewed and provided comments on the City's draft Sustainability website.

- Held special meetings with community sustainability partners, including the City's Solid Waste Manager and the Butte County Association of Governments' Executive Director to discuss status of relevant solid waste and transportation-related CAP actions and to provide comments and recommendations for improving recycling city-wide and increasing B-Line ridership.
- Continued sub-committee meetings and developed the following Council recommendations:

#### Energy Sub-Committee

Increased Building Code Requirements - City should adopt voluntary Green Building Code measures that would further the City's GHG emissions reduction goal during the Building Plan Check process. (**Status:** Recommendation is a Phase 2 Action, which will be brought to Council later in 2015)

Incentives for Alternative Energy Installation – City should incentivize Building Fees (e.g., reduce fees) for alternative energy installations. (**Status:** Recommendation to be brought to Council later in 2015 when it considers a minor User Fee update)

#### Transportation Sub-Committee

Provision of EV Fueling Stations – City should amend development standards (Title 19) to require EV fueling stations for new parking lots of a certain size, and retrofit strategic City-owned Downtown parking lots to include EV fueling stations. (**Status:** Recommendation would be incorporated into 5-Year General Plan Update process to proceed in 2015/2016)

#### Solid Waste Sub-Committee

Solid Waste Franchise Agreement – The STF the following two recommendations regarding the under development Franchise Agreement: 1) ensure that the Solid Waste Franchise Options document includes all relevant actions and concepts from the City's adopted Climate Action Plan, and that any future franchise agreement provide an opportunity to incorporate new technology that would further the Climate Action Plan's goals; and 2) ensure that the Solid Waste Franchise Options document includes a requirement that any future hauler under a new franchise agreement provide quarterly reporting on its education and outreach efforts regarding recycling to multi-family and commercial clients and provide quantitative data regarding meeting state-mandated recycling goals. (**Status:** recommendations are consistent with direction already received by the City's consultant, R3)

### **2015 Work Plan**

At its first meeting in 2015, the STF developed a work plan to focus its 2015 efforts. Below are the work plan components and the proposed timeframes:

- Review and evaluate Phase I CAP actions to determine if projected GHG emission reductions have been achieved (6 months).
- Continue to meet with key sustainability partners, specifically PG&E and Cal-Water, to discuss relevant energy-related CAP actions, identify areas of mutual support, and assist the

STF in its development of additional recommendations for Council's consideration (6 months).

- Maximize use of the City's Sustainability website as an information hub for how residents and businesses can implement sustainable practices (ongoing).
- Investigate social media options (e.g., Facebook) to further connect with the community, and highlight educational material and funding opportunities (6 months).
- Finalize a metric for tracking annual community-wide GHG emissions based on four key variables: electricity consumption, natural gas consumption, fuel consumption, and waste sent to the landfill (3 months).
- Workshop Series – STF members and City staff will partner with the Chamber of Commerce, DCBA, BCAG, PG&E, Cal Water, Chico Velo, and others to engage local contractors, large employers (Enloe, CUSD, CSUC, etc.), and key commercial hubs (Chico Mall area, Hegan Lane Business Park, North Valley Plaza Mall, large grocery complexes, etc.) in a series of workshops to provide information, inspiration, and motivation to incorporate sustainable business practices. Workshops would proceed in the following order: 1) energy efficiency, 2) alternative transportation, 3) water conservation, and 4) solid waste. The workshops will be venues to share information, provide testimonials, and highlight rebates, tools and special programs available to businesses to save money (2 workshops in first 6 months/2 workshops in last 6 months).

cc: CM, ACM, CDD, L. Herman, STF members, Chamber of Commerce

## 2015 STF Work Plan/Status Update

At its first meeting in 2015, the STF developed a work plan to focus its 2015 efforts. Below are the work plan components, the proposed timeframes, and a status:

- Review and evaluate key Phase I CAP actions to determine if projected GHG emission reductions have been achieved (6 months). **Status: Incomplete, but not identified as a high priority at last Work Plan “check in”.**
- Continue to meet with key sustainability partners, specifically PG&E and Cal-Water, to discuss relevant energy-related CAP actions, identify areas of mutual support, and assist the STF in its development of additional recommendations for Council's consideration (6 months). **Status: Generally Complete and ongoing.**
- Maximize use of the City's Sustainability website as an information hub for how residents and businesses can implement sustainable practices (ongoing). **Status: Complete and ongoing.**
- Investigate social media options (e.g., Facebook) to further connect with the community, and highlight educational material and funding opportunities (6 months). **Status: Investigation determined that the City's Information Services Division has stiff criteria for creating an “official” City Facebook page, and for other social media tools. Currently, Parks and PD have Facebook presence, but it is overseen and regularly updated by a dedicated City staff member.**
- Finalize a metric for tracking annual community-wide GHG emissions based on four key variables: electricity consumption, natural gas consumption, fuel consumption, and waste sent to the landfill (3 months). **Status: Complete.**
- Workshop Series – STF members and City staff will partner with the Chamber of Commerce, DCBA, BCAG, PG&E, Cal Water, Chico Velo, and others to engage local contractors, large employers (Enloe, CUSD, CSUC, etc.), and key commercial hubs (Chico Mall area, Hegan Lane Business Park, North Valley Plaza Mall, large grocery complexes, etc.) in a series of workshops to provide information, inspiration, and motivation to incorporate sustainable business practices. Workshops would proceed in the following order: 1) energy efficiency, 2) alternative transportation, 3) water conservation, and 4) solid waste. The workshops will be venues to share information, provide testimonials, and highlight rebates, tools and special programs available to businesses to save money (2 workshops in first 6 months/2 workshops in last 6 months). **Status: Complete and Ongoing (Workshop Series will run again in 2016).**