The applicant requests that the Board forward a recommendation of approval to the Planning Commission for the design of a 23-unit multi-family housing development. The Planning Commission will forward a recommendation to the City Council for final consideration of the General Plan Amendment and Rezone, including the final architectural design approval.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and recommend approval of the project, subject to conditions.

Proposed Motion

I move that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and recommend approval of The Humboldt (AR 19-09), subject to conditions.

BACKGROUND

The 1.24-acre site is located on the southwest corner of the intersection of Humboldt Road and Forest Avenue. The site is bounded by Little Chico Creek to the south, Humboldt Road to the north, Forest Avenue to the east and a single-family home to the west (see location map, Attachment A). The site is currently designated Low Density Residential in the General Plan Land Use Diagram and is zoned R1 (Low Density Residential). A General Plan Amendment and Rezone of the property is necessary to allow for multi-family development.

DISCUSSION AND ANALYSIS

The site plan depicts the proposed layout of the site (see Attachment B, Overall Site Plan). Residential buildings would be organized in an “L-shape”, forming a central courtyard between the buildings. The central bulk of the buildings would be three stories in height, tapering down to two-story buildings. A single-story parking garage would be positioned along the westerly property line. The easterly portion of the site is City-owned right-of-way, and uncovered parking is authorized in this area through a Grant of License, approved by the City Council on
2/06/2019. New landscaping, trash enclosure, site lighting and residential amenities are proposed.

Architecture

The project embodies nearly identical architectural design traits as the previously-constructed “Arcadian” multi-family housing project, located on West 8th Avenue and Arcadian Avenue. The architectural style provides a clear interpretation of the Mission Revival which blends old Spanish elements including stucco walls, heavy timber beams, columns, guard rails, window, and door trim (see Attachments C, Elevations and Attachment D, Project Images). Exterior wall surfaces would be stucco in a light cream color (La Habra “Eggshell”). Window and door trim for residential units would be green (“Hemlock Green”) and breezeway entries and walls would be trimmed in red (“Roycroft Adobe”). A flat tile concrete roof system in terra cotta (“Santa Clara Blend”) would be applied throughout all buildings. Second and third-story balconies would include timber-beam frames in a dark custom stain. Decorative iron in matte black would be used for balcony railings, as well as the ornate entry gates which provide access to the central courtyard from the exterior of the site. Garage doors would be dark green (“Roycroft Bronze Green”) and exterior wall-mounted utilities and entry-doors would be framed with timber trellis structures. Monterey Style details would be incorporated throughout the site, including terra cotta tile flooring in the central courtyard and hand-painted tiles in decorative fountains and trimming exterior stairways.

Site Plan

The buildings are oriented such that they form an “L-shape”, with a central courtyard in the middle. Entry to the buildings is provided by several secured breezeways on all sides of the building site to the courtyard area. Entry to the residential units is provided within the courtyard, either by ground-level entries, or by an exterior staircase. Residential amenities are provided within the courtyard area, including extensive seating areas, barbeques and outdoor fireplace. Portions of the complex fronting Humboldt Avenue are setback ten feet, providing private outdoor space for ground-floor units. The rear portion of the buildings are setback 15-feet from the rear property line, providing additional seating areas to view and enjoy Little Chico Creek. The detached garage structure positioned along the easterly property line is set back five-feet. The garage structure is 15 feet tall and would function as a screen between the proposed project and existing single-family home to the west.

The parking layout is such that the apartment complex is central to the site, with garage parking to the west and uncovered parking to the east. A total of 27 bicycle parking spaces are provided on site, including two U-shaped bicycle racks located toward the easterly vehicle entry, and within private garages. A total of 48 vehicle parking spaces are provided on site, including 23 garages spaces and 25 uncovered parking spaces. The code typically requires 35 off-street spaces for the proposed mix of units and bedrooms, including guest parking. Chico Municipal Code 19.70.040.F requires that parking spaces which exceed the minimum number of spaces required by more than 35-percent may be allowed when a combination of additional landscaping, pedestrian/bicycle improvements, and/or pervious surfaces are provided. Given the layout of the proposed parking area away from the public right-of-way and abundant landscape screening of the parking area, staff supports the proposed parking.

The proposed landscape plan calls for retention of a large valley oak tree located near the
southerly property line. To ensure retention of the tree, and to comply with the City’s Tree Preservation Regulations (Chico Municipal Code (CMC) 16.66), a condition of approval is recommended that would require the applicant to submit a tree protection plan to the City’s Urban Forest Manager prior to any site disturbance (see condition of approval #2(e). A total of eight trees would be removed from the project site, including three which qualify for mitigation pursuant to CMC 16.66 (Tree Preservation Regulations).

The landscape plans call for a variety of species with moderate to low water demands (see Attachment E, Landscape Plans). A mixture of trees, shrubs, and perennials are proposed around the new buildings, within the central courtyard and throughout the new parking area. A total of 76 new trees would be planted on site, including 38 parking lot shade trees and 38 landscape trees. Parking lot shade is estimated to reach 53-percent at full tree maturity, and would include a mixture of Chinese pistache, redwood and Arizona cypress trees. A variety of plants and groundcover would be incorporated within the courtyard area, as well as along the Humboldt Avenue frontage.

Decorative light fixture details throughout the project site would maintain the Monterey Style. Ornamental wall-mounted sconces are proposed to illuminate residential entries and walking areas as well as garage entries and the central courtyard. Hanging chandelier fixtures would illuminate breezeway corridors and low intensity pole fixtures are proposed throughout the uncovered parking area (see Attachment F, Photometrics Plan).

The overall design provides a strong sense of place which is supported by the Monterey Style architecture which is consistent with old Chico. The project design and style are consistent with several General Plan goals and policies, including those that promote architectural design that exhibits timeless character and is constructed with high quality materials (CD-3.1) and ensure project design that reinforces a sense of place with context sensitive elements and a human scale (CD-3). The layout of the site is consistent with Open Space goals and policies that require a minimum 25-foot setback from the top of creek banks (OS-2.5.1) and the retention of woodland habitat (OS-2.6).

The project is consistent with objectives of the Design Guidelines (DG) Manual. The strong architectural theme and style establishes a unified project identity, placing the single-story garage at the project edge creates a logical transition to the adjacent single-family home and front porches relate to the human scale (4.2.12, 4.2.22 and 4.2.32). Design Guidelines call for providing one or more amenities when designing multifamily projects (DG 4.1.45); the project includes ample outdoor seating areas within an enclosed courtyard area and successfully engages the creekside greenway which would provide both active and passive recreation opportunities for adults and children. Porches and balconies that enliven the public street, creating a sense of community and “eyes on the street” (DG 4.1.21 and 4.1.24). The central courtyard accessed by all sides of the site creates a sense of community and design oriented to the pedestrian, and provides ample residential amenities, consistent with DG 4.1.41, 4.1.43, 4.1.45, 4.1.11 and 4.1.13. The projects massing breaks the building up into two- and three-story portions, creating a sense of interest, variety, and avoids a monotonous streetscape (DG 4.1.14, 4.1.15 and 4.1.23). Further design consistency can be found in Attachment G, Project Description.
REQUIRED FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL

Environmental Review

Based on the results of an Initial Study a Mitigated Negative Declaration was prepared for the project and circulated for a 30-day comment period, commencing on 12/19/2018, and extending until 1/17/2019. No correspondence has been received during and prior to the public review period as of the date of this report. Any correspondence received after the date of this report will be presented at the public hearing. The Mitigated Negative Declaration and Mitigation Monitoring Program is included as Attachment H of this report and all mitigation measures have been included as conditions of approval.

Architectural Review

According to the Chico Municipal Code Section 19.18.060, the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board shall determine whether or not a project adequately meets adopted City standards and design guidelines based on the required findings itemized below.

1. The proposed development is consistent with the General Plan, any applicable specific plan, and any applicable neighborhood or area plans.

The overall design provides a strong sense of place which is supported by the Monterey Style architecture which is consistent with old Chico. The project design and style are consistent with several General Plan goals and policies, including those that promote architectural design that exhibits timeless character and is constructed with high quality materials (CD-3.1) and ensure project design that reinforces a sense of place with context sensitive elements and a human scale (CD-3). The layout of the site is consistent with Open Space goals and policies that require a minimum 25-foot setback from the top of creek banks (OS-2.5.1) and the retention of woodland habitat (OS-2.6).

2. The proposed development, including the character, scale, and quality of design are consistent with the purpose/intent of this chapter and any adopted design guidelines.

The project is consistent with objectives of the Design Guidelines (DG) Manual. The strong architectural theme and style establishes a unified project identity, placing the single-story garage at the project edge creates a logical transition to the adjacent single-family home and front porches relate to the human scale (4.2.12, 4.2.22 and 4.2.32). The project successfully engages the creekside greenway while including porches and balconies that enliven the public street, creating a sense of community and “eyes on the street” (DG 4.1.21 and 4.1.24). The central courtyard accessed by all sides of the site creates a sense of community and design oriented to the pedestrian, and provides ample residential amenities, consistent with DG 4.1.41, 4.1.43, 4.1.45, 4.1.11 and 4.1.13. The projects massing breaks the building up into two- and three-story portions, creating a sense of interest, variety and avoids a monotonous streetscape (DG 4.1.14, 4.1.15 and 4.1.23).

3. The architectural design of structures, including all elevations, materials and colors are visually compatible with surrounding development. Design elements, including
screening of equipment, exterior lighting, signs, and awnings, have been incorporated into the project to further ensure its compatibility with the character and uses of adjacent development.

The design, materials and color palette of the proposed apartment complex are visually compatible with the surrounding neighborhood while establishing a strong architectural theme. Exterior equipment will be properly screened from public view within roof wells. Parking lot lighting is proposed at a pedestrian scale and will not result in any unnecessary source of glare or contribution to the night sky pollution.

4. The location and configuration of structures are compatible with their sites and with surrounding sites and structures, and do not unnecessarily block views from other structures or dominate their surroundings.

The proposed project will not unnecessarily block views. The buildings may, at first, appear to dominate their surroundings, but are appropriately set back from the public right-of-way, the creek side greenway and neighboring uses. Further, extensive landscaping is provided along the Forest Avenue frontage, softening the building appearance while providing a prominent way-finding feature.

5. The general landscape design, including the color, location, size, texture, type, and coverage of plant materials, and provisions for irrigation and maintenance, and protection of landscape elements, have been considered to ensure visual relief, to complement structures, and to provide an attractive environment.

The landscape plans call for a variety of species with moderate to low water demands. A mixture of trees, shrubs, and perennials are proposed around the new buildings, within the central courtyard and throughout the new parking area. A total of 76 new trees would be planted on site, including 38 parking lot shade trees and 38 landscape trees. Parking lot shade is estimated to reach 53-percent at full tree maturity, and would include a mixture of Chinese pistache, redwood and Arizona cypress trees. A variety of plants and groundcover would be incorporated within the courtyard area, as well as along the Humboldt Avenue frontage.

RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The front page of all approved building plans shall note in bold type face that the project shall comply with AR 19-09 (The Humboldt). No building permits related to this approval shall be finaled without prior authorization of Community Development Department planning staff.

2. As required by CMC 16.66, trees removed shall be replaced as follows:

   a. On-site. For every six inches in DBH removed, a new 15-gallon tree shall be planted on-site. Replacement trees shall be of similar species, unless otherwise approved by the urban forest manager, and shall be placed in areas dedicated for tree plantings. New plantings’ survival shall be ensured for three years after the date of planting and shall be verified by the applicant upon request by the director. If any replacement trees
die or fail within the first three years of their planting, then the applicant shall pay an in-
lieu fee as established by a fee schedule adopted by the City Council.

b. Off-site. If it is not feasible or desirable to plant replacement trees on-site, payment of
an in-lieu fee as established by a fee schedule adopted by the City Council shall be
required.

c. Replacement trees shall not receive credit as satisfying shade or street tree
requirements otherwise mandated by the municipal code.

d. Tree removal shall be subject to the in-lieu fee payment requirements set forth by Chico
Municipal Code (CMC) 16.66 and fee schedule adopted by the City Council.

e. All trees not approved for removal shall be preserved on and adjacent to the project
site. A tree preservation plan, including fencing around drip lines and methods for
excavation within the drip lines of protected trees to be preserved shall be prepared by
the project developer pursuant to CMC 16.66.110 and 19.68.060 for review and
approval by planning staff prior to any ground-disturbing activities.

3. MITIGATION D.1 (Biological Resources): If construction is scheduled to occur within the
nesting season (February 1 – August 31), the developer shall hire a qualified biologist to
conduct a preconstruction survey of the project site to identify any active nests within 250
feet of the project area. The survey will be conducted no more than 7 days before the
beginning of initial ground disturbances. If nesting raptors or migratory birds are found during
the survey, impacts will be avoided by establishment of appropriate buffers. No construction
activities will commence within the buffer area until a qualified biologist confirms that the nest
is no longer active. California Department of Fish and Wildlife guidelines recommend
implementation of 500-foot buffers around construction areas, but the size of the buffer may
be adjusted if a qualified biologist determines that construction activities would not likely
adversely affect the nest. Monitoring of the nest by a qualified biologist may be required if
the activity has potential to adversely affect the nest. The migratory bird survey shall be
conducted by a qualified, professional biologist.

4. MITIGATION E.1. (Cultural Resources): A note shall be placed on all grading and
construction plans which informs the construction contractor that if any bones, pottery
fragments or other potential cultural resources are encountered during construction, all work
shall cease within the area of the find pending an examination of the site and materials by a
professional archaeologist. If during ground disturbing activities, any bones, pottery
fragments or other potential cultural resources are encountered, the developer or their
supervising contractor shall cease all work within the area of the find and notify Planning staff
at (530) 879-6800. A professional archaeologist who meets the Secretary of the Interior’s
Professional Qualification Standards for prehistoric and historic archaeology and who is
familiar with the archaeological record of Butte County, shall be retained by the applicant to
evaluate the significance of the find. Further, Planning staff shall notify all local tribes on the
consultation list maintained by the State of California Native American Heritage Commission,
to provide local tribes the opportunity to monitor evaluation of the site. Site work shall not
resume until the archaeologist conducts sufficient research, testing and analysis of the
archaeological evidence to make a determination that the resource is either not cultural in
origin or not potentially significant. If a potentially significant resource is encountered, the
archaeologist shall prepare a mitigation plan for review and approval by the Community Development Director, including recommendations for total data recovery, Tribal monitoring, disposition protocol, or avoidance, if applicable. All measures determined by the Community Development Director to be appropriate shall be implemented pursuant to the terms of the archaeologist’s report. The preceding requirement shall be incorporated into construction contracts and plans to ensure contractor knowledge and responsibility for proper implementation.

PUBLIC CONTACT

A notice was published in the Chico Enterprise Record 10 days prior to the meeting date, notices were mailed out to all property owners and tenants within 500 feet of the project site, and a notice was placed on the project site. The meeting agenda was posted at least 10 days prior to the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board meeting.

ATTACHMENTS

A. Location Map
B. Overall Site Plan
C. Elevations
D. Project Images
E. Landscape Plan
F. Photometrics Plan
G. Project Description
H. MND and MMRP

DISTRIBUTION

Internal
Mike Sawley, Senior Planner
Shannon Costa, Associate Planner
File: AR 19-09

External
Thomas T. van Overbeek, 539 Flume Street, suite 210, Chico, CA 95926
(tom@chicopartners.com)
RGA, attn.: Kevin Easterling, 115 Meyers Street, suite 110, Chico, CA 95928,
(kevin@rgachico.com)
EXTERIOR PLASTER SYSTEM: LA HABRA STUCCO WITH FINE FINISH, INTEGRAL COLOR TOP COAT EGG SHELL 73
EXTERIOR WOOD: CUSTOM COLOR STAIN
FACTORY FINISH: HEMLOCK GREEN
CONCRETE TILE ROOF: EAGLE ROOFING FLAT TILE SMB 8820 SANTA CLARA BLEND
EXTERIOR METALS: POWDER COAT SATIN BLACK
WD-1
FF-1
CT-1
MTL-1
EXTERIOR GARAGE DOOR: ROYCROFT BRONZE GREEN SW 2846
P-1
EXTERIOR ENTRANCE ACCENT: ROYCROFT ADOBE SW 0040
P-2
GENERAL NOTES:
ALL FLASHING AND ROOF TOP PENETRATIONS TO BE PAINTED TO MATCH ADJACENT ROOF, WALL, OR TRIM COLOR AS APPLICABLE. NO UNPAINTED, GALVANIZED FLASHING OR VENTS TO BE VISIBLE.

LIGHT FIXTURE TYPE BLIGHT FIXTURE TYPE A SINGLE HUNG WINDOW TYPICAL ENTRANCE, SITE WALL, BALCONY
**EXTERIOR GARAGE DOOR:** ROYCROFT BRONZE GREEN SW 2846

**EXTERIOR ENTRANCE ACCENT:** ROYCROFT ADOBE SW 0040 P-2

**GENERAL NOTES:**
- All flashing and roof top penetrations to be painted to match adjacent roof, wall, or trim color as applicable.
- No unainted, galvanized flashing or vents to be visible.

**Light Fixture Type:** LIGHT FIXTURE TYPE A

**Single Hung Window Typical:** ENTRANCE, SITE WALL, BALCONY

**Scale:** 1/8" = 1'-0"
PHOTO DESCRIPTION AND DISCLAIMER:

THE IMAGES CONTAINED IN THIS MODULE ARE REAL PHOTOGRAPHS OF THE ARCADIAN APARTMENT BUILDING, LOCATED AT 1740 ARCADIAN AVENUE. THIS PROJECT WAS COMPLETED BY CHICO PARTNERS, AND IS AN EXCELLENT EXAMPLE OF THE STYLE AND QUALITY PROPOSED FOR THE HUMBOLDT. THESE IMAGES DO NOT DEPICT EXACT FINISHES, FIXTURES, DIMENSIONS, OR DETAILS PROPOSED FOR THE HUMBOLDT, BUT ARE INSTEAD INTENDED TO PROVIDE A VISUAL REFERENCE FOR THE STYLE AND QUALITY OF THE PROPOSED PROJECT.
March 11, 2019

City of Chico Planning Department
P.O. Box 3420
Chico, Ca. 95924

RE: The Humboldt
Apartment Building
Chico CA, 95928
APN: 002-110-034

Dear Shannon,

It is with pleasure that I take this opportunity to provide you the following overview of The Humboldt apartment building on behalf of RGA and Chico Partners. Where appropriate, the following narrative references the “Residential Project Types” section of the City of Chico Design Guidelines – Chapter 2 (as reference by “DG” in this document).

Brief History
This property was previously developed as a single-family residence, which had become dilapidated over time, and was eventually demolished. The parcel is currently undeveloped, and is bounded by Humboldt Road to the North, a vacant city-owned parcel to the East, Little Chico Creek to the South, and a single-family residence to the West.

Proposed Architectural Elements
The Humboldt will contain 23 residential apartment units as well as individual private parking garages. The building massing is organized into two elements: a two-story L-Shaped portion orientated towards the North and West sides of the property, and a two- and three-story portion oriented towards the South and East sides of the property. This building has nine 1 bed 1 bath, ten 2 bed 2 bath, and four 3 bed 2 bath apartment units. As this building contains an elevator, all units are proposed to be accessible. All ground-floor units feature a private patio, and all upper-floor units feature private outdoor balconies.

The proposed building design, materials, and colors were selected to represent a timeless style to its residents and the surrounding neighborhood. This project features a local
interpretation of Mission Revival architecture, grounding itself in a traditional style while ensuring its appropriateness to local climatic and practical needs. By combining a courtyard apartment configuration with rich detailing and characteristic materials, The Humboldt truly aims to be an excellent project that will establish a legacy of quality. The developer, Chico Partners, has already begun a legacy of its own, developing quality infill-oriented apartment and commercial properties in Chico. The Arcadian apartment building (located at 1740 Arcadian Avenue) is an excellent example of the quality and excellence this project proposes to represent, and is referenced throughout this submittal through the inclusion of photographs of the completed project.

Applicable City of Chico Design Guidelines Objectives

DG 4.1.1 – Building Placement and Orientation
- **DG 4.1.11:** Create a sense of community with designs oriented to the pedestrian - This project features several public-facing patios, balconies, and windows along Humboldt Road and the parking lot on the East side. Entrances to the building are also provided on each side of the building as well.
- **DG 4.1.13:** Orient multiple-family residential development to the street and pedestrians - The organization of this project focuses on pedestrian access, privacy, and on providing access and views to the creek, internal courtyards, views to the foothills, and adjacent existing groves of trees and greenery. The building features four entrances to the internal courtyards from several access points, including the public way on Humboldt Road, private gated parking on the West, open parking lot on the East, and a private outdoor amenity space on the South.
- **DG 4.1.14:** Create interest and variety with a mix of building types - The main building of this project is organized into a mixture of two- and three-story portions to provide visual interest by breaking up the massing of the building. To reduce the visual impact of the three-story portion of the building on surrounding properties and streetscapes, two story portions have intentionally been located towards the front and side property lines, while three story portions have been located towards the center and rear of the parcel. The single-story garage building has been located on the West side of the parcel. This stepped approach provides a graduation of massing that is appropriate for and consistent with the one- and two-story nature of adjacent existing buildings in the local area.
- **DG 4.1.15, 4.1.23:** Avoid monotonous streetscape - All façades of the building feature articulation and stepping in the wall surfaces to provide visual interest. Balconies and patios reinforce this articulation with detailing and materials that define the architectural style.

DG 4.1.2 Building Placement and Orientation
- **DG 4.1.21:** Maintain views from residential units, common buildings - All apartments located in the South portion of the building, as well as many of the
apartments in the North portion, have views to the creekside greenway. Many of the apartments in both the South and North portions have been configured to have views to the adjacent existing groves of trees and greenery, as well as to the foothills beyond.

- **DG 4.1.23: Design multi-family buildings with varieties of building masses** – As previously mentioned, the building has been subdivided into two- and three-story portions, organized in a stepped or graduated fashion. This organization combined with an articulation of facades with wall steps, balconies, and pop-outs provides a variety of building masses.

- **DG 4.1.24: Include front porches and balconies** – This project features numerous balconies and private garden areas oriented towards the public street.

**DG 4.1.3 Internal Circulation**

- **DG 4.1.31: Logical, safe vehicle and pedestrian circulation** – Pedestrian circulation is separated from vehicle circulation through means of internal courtyards. Guest parking is provided at the East parking lot, while the West parking lot remains secure for access by residents via remote-control.

- **DG 4.1.35: Integrate projects into public street and sidewalk system** – The project proposes a new public sidewalk with pedestrian access to both parking lots, as well as to the common entrances on Humboldt Road and from the East parking lot.

**DG 4.1.4 – Public Space/Pedestrian Amenities**

- **DG 4.1.41, 4.1.43: Convenient pedestrian access to amenities** – Guests and residents can access common area amenity spaces in the internal courtyard via any of the four common entrances proposed. They can also access common area amenity space on the South side of the project via the internal courtyards or either of the two gates from the parking lots on the East or West side. Additionally, each apartment is provided with a ground-floor private garden space, or an upper-level balcony.

- **DG 4.1.44: Appropriate lighting for common open space** – A combination of pole-mounted and wall-mounted light fixtures provide general illumination for the parking lots, pedestrian traffic areas, and amenity areas.

- **DG 4.1.45: Provide amenities** – View to the natural open spaces on the South and East of the project will be provided from the common area amenity space on the South side of the project. Numerous amenities will be provided throughout the internal courtyards including seating benches, a double-sided fireplace, barbecues, tables, and “outdoor living room” style seating areas.
DG 4.1.5 - Parking

- **DG 4.1.51: Consider shared driveways** – Access to garage spaces on the West side is provided from an internal drive aisle, lined with planting pockets, shade trees, and colored concrete to provide visual interest. Access to garage space on the East side is provided from the parking lot, and features similar planting and concrete treatments to reduce the visual impact of the garage doors and their required access.

- **DG 4.1.52: Parking** – Parking for this project is provided in two surface parking lots on the East and West sides of the property, as well as several private parking garages. The parking lot on the West side is private, and accessed via a remote-controlled sliding vehicle gate, as well as a locked pedestrian gate. The parking lot on the East side is accessible to guests and for public access for use of the city owned property directly to the East of the parcel as required by that property's grant of license. An elevator is proposed to help provide better and more convenient access from parking spaces to apartment units.

- **DG 4.1.55: Screening of parking** – The East parking lot will be screened from view by existing planting and groves of trees adjacent to Forest Avenue.

DG 4.1.6 - Garage Placement and Design

- **DG 4.1.61: Minimize visual impact of garages** – See response to DG 4.1.51.

DG 4.2.1 - Massing, Scale, and Form

- **DG 4.2.11: Reduce architectural massing** – Individual apartment units are identified on the exterior-facing facades by overhanging balconies and their associated doors and windows.

- **DG 4.2.12: Transition scale of multi-unit structures along project edge** – See response to DG 4.1.14. Careful attention has been paid to the scale and height of this building as it relates to existing adjacent uses. The single-story garage building has been placed along the shared property line between multi-family and single-family uses. Also, the three-story portion of the building has been shifted away from the street towards the center of the property to provide the necessary transition in scale.

- **DG 4.2.14: Achieve a pedestrian-level scale** – Detail at an appropriate scale has been placed adjacent to sidewalks and street frontages, including balconies, wall-mounted lights, planted areas, roof overhangs with exposed timber rafter tails, and exposed timber trellises.
DG 4.2.2 – Style and Design Details

- **DG 4.2.22: Establish a unified project identity** - As previously mentioned, this project incorporates numerous details to embrace the legacy of the Mission Revival architectural style.
- **DG 4.2.41: Clearly denote front entrances** - Common entrances to the building have been identified by arched entryways featuring wall-mounted light fixtures flanking an ornamental iron gate.
- **DG 4.2.43: Include entries that provide protection from the elements** - All private entries to apartment units are covered overhead by either roof overhangs or covered walkways above.
- **DG 4.2.44: Offer sufficient security for residents** - Security is provided for residents via gated common entries to the building at all access points to the internal courtyards.

Thank-you for your thoughtful consideration and we look forward to questions and discussions pertaining to this project.

Sincerely,

[Signature]

Kevin Egsterling
Russell Gallaway Associates, Inc.
Based upon the analysis and findings contained within the attached Initial Study, a Mitigated Negative Declaration is proposed by the City of Chico Planning Division for the following project:

**PROJECT NAME AND NUMBER:** General Plan Amendment and Rezone 17-01, and Architectural Review 17-17 (Humboldt Van Overbeek Apartments)

**APPLICANT’S NAME:** Tom van Overbeek  
539 Flume Street, Suite 210, Chico, CA 95928

**PROJECT LOCATION:** 1991 Humboldt Road, Chico, Butte County, CA  
Southwest corner of Forest Avenue and Humboldt Road

**PROJECT DESCRIPTION:** The applicant proposes to amend the Chico General Plan Land Use Diagram to change the site’s designation from Low Density Residential (2.1-7 du/ac) to Medium-High Density Residential (14.1-22 du/ac), and to amend the City’s Zoning Map to change the site’s zoning classification from R1 (Low Density Residential) to R3 (Medium-High Density Residential).

The proposed re-designation and re-zoning of the site are necessary to allow a site design and architectural review proposal by the applicant to develop a multi-family residential apartment complex in conformance with the city’s land use and development regulations. The applicant has expressed an intent to construct 25 to 28 apartments, which would result in a residential density range of approximately 16 dwelling units per acre to 17.5 dwelling units per acre. The potential for maximum build out of the site with 35 multi-family residential units is contemplated by the document. Access to the site would be exclusively from Humboldt Road with an encroachment onto the east-adjacent OS1-zoned (Primary Open Space) property for vehicle parking affiliated with the proposed multi-family residential complex and for public use. The OS1-zoned property is owned by the City of Chico and was approved for a Grant of License by the Chico City Council in February 2018 to allow for the encroachment. Future development would be subject to public hearings, by the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board, Planning Commission and City Council.

**FINDING:** As supported by the attached Initial Study there is no substantial evidence, in light of the whole record before the agency, that the project will have a significant effect on the environment if the following mitigation measures are adopted and implemented for the project:

**MITIGATION C.1 (Air Quality):** To reduce long-term air quality impacts from future development at the project site, operational mitigation measures shall be incorporated into the design of the project as specified in Appendix C of the Butte County Air Quality Management District’s CEQA Air Quality Handbook, October 23, 2014, available at http://bcaqmd.org/wp-content/uploads/CEQA-Handbook-Appendices-2014.pdf. These measures include but are not limited to:

- Utilizing energy-efficient lighting systems.
- Utilizing energy-efficient and/or automated controls for heating and air conditioning.
- Utilizing EPA Phase II certified wood burning devices.
- Installing additional bicycle racks or storage facilities to encourage alternatives to driving vehicles.
- Including additional shade trees to maximize natural cooling.
• Utilizing centralized space and water heating and/or use of solar water heating.

**MITIGATION MONITORING C.1:** During the architectural review process and prior to building permit issuance, City Planning and Building staff will review project plans to ensure that Mitigation Measure C.1. is incorporated into the project design, as appropriate.

Implementation of the above measure will minimize potential air quality impacts to a level that is considered **less than significant with mitigation incorporated.**

**MITIGATION D.1 (Biological Resources):**
If construction is scheduled to occur within the nesting season (February 1 – August 31), the developer shall hire a qualified biologist to conduct a preconstruction survey of the project site to identify any active nests within 250 feet of the project area. The survey will be conducted no more than 7 days before the beginning of initial ground disturbances. If nesting raptors or migratory birds are found during the survey, impacts will be avoided by establishment of appropriate buffers. No construction activities will commence within the buffer area until a qualified biologist confirms that the nest is no longer active. California Department of Fish and Wildlife guidelines recommend implementation of 500 foot buffers around construction areas, but the size of the buffer may be adjusted if a qualified biologist determines that construction activities would not likely adversely affect the nest. Monitoring of the nest by a qualified biologist may be required if the activity has potential to adversely affect the nest. The migratory bird survey shall be conducted by a qualified, professional biologist.

**MITIGATION MONITORING D.1:** Planning staff will require submittal of a bird survey prior to issuance of any grading or building permit for the project, unless the work will commence during the non-breeding season (September 1 – January 31).

Implementation of the above measure will avoid potential violations of the Migratory Bird Treaty Act of 1918, as amended, and will reduce potential impacts to migratory birds to a level that is considered **less than significant with mitigation incorporated.**

**MITIGATION E.1. (Cultural Resources):** A note shall be placed on all grading and construction plans which informs the construction contractor that if any bones, pottery fragments or other potential cultural resources are encountered during construction, all work shall cease within the area of the find pending an examination of the site and materials by a professional archaeologist. If during ground disturbing activities, any bones, pottery fragments or other potential cultural resources are encountered, the developer or their supervising contractor shall cease all work within the area of the find and notify Planning staff at (530) 879-6800. A professional archaeologist who meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Professional Qualification Standards for prehistoric and historic archaeology and who is familiar with the archaeological record of Butte County, shall be retained by the applicant to evaluate the significance of the find. Further, Planning staff shall notify all local tribes on the consultation list maintained by the State of California Native American Heritage Commission, to provide local tribes the opportunity to monitor evaluation of the site. Site work shall not resume until the archaeologist conducts sufficient research, testing and analysis of the archaeological evidence to make a determination that the resource is either not cultural in origin or not potentially significant. If a potentially significant resource is encountered, the archaeologist shall prepare a mitigation plan for review and approval by the Community Development Director, including recommendations for total data recovery, Tribal monitoring, disposition protocol, or avoidance, if applicable. All measures determined by the Community Development Director to be appropriate shall be implemented pursuant to the terms of the archaeologist’s report. The preceding requirement shall be incorporated into construction contracts and plans to ensure contractor knowledge and responsibility for proper implementation.
Mitigation Monitoring E.1: Planning staff will verify that the above wording is included on construction plans. Should cultural resources be encountered, the supervising contractor shall be responsible for reporting any such findings to Planning staff, and contacting a professional archaeologist, in consultation with Planning staff, to evaluate the find.

Implementation of the above measure will minimize potentially significant impacts to previously unknown cultural resources that could be unearthed during construction activities, and will reduce potential impacts to cultural resources to a level that is considered less than significant with mitigation incorporated.

PROJECT APPLICANT’S INCORPORATION OF MITIGATION INTO THE PROPOSED PROJECT:

I have reviewed the Initial Study for Architectural Review 17-17 and General Plan Amendment and Rezone 17-01 (Humboldt Van Overbeek Apartments), and the mitigation measures identified herein.

______________________________
Tom Van Overbeek
Project Applicant

Prepared by: ____________________________ 12-14-18
Kimber Gutierrez, Associate Planner
Community Development Department

Adopted via: Resolution No:__________________________
City of Chico City Council

Date
## Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mitigation Measure</th>
<th>Responsibility for Implementation</th>
<th>Mitigation Timing</th>
<th>Enforcement Responsibility</th>
<th>Verification of Compliance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>MM C.1 Air Quality</strong></td>
<td>Project Applicant</td>
<td>During the architectural review process and prior to building permit issuance.</td>
<td>City of Chico Planning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To reduce long-term air quality impacts from future development at the project site, operational mitigation measures shall be incorporated into the design of the project as specified in Appendix C of the Butte County Air Quality Management District’s CEQA Air Quality Handbook, October 23, 2014, available at <a href="http://bcaqmd.org/wp-content/uploads/CEQA-Handbook-Appendices-2014.pdf">http://bcaqmd.org/wp-content/uploads/CEQA-Handbook-Appendices-2014.pdf</a>. These measures include but are not limited to: ◦ Utilizing energy-efficient lighting systems. ◦ Utilizing energy-efficient and/or automated controls for heating and air conditioning. ◦ Utilizing EPA Phase II certified wood burning devices. ◦ Installing additional bicycle racks or storage facilities to encourage alternatives to driving vehicles. ◦ Including additional shade trees to maximize natural cooling. ◦ Utilizing centralized space and water heating and/or use of solar water heating.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MM D.1 Biological Resources</strong></td>
<td>Project Applicant</td>
<td>Planning staff will require submittal of a bird survey prior to issuance of any grading or building permit for the project, unless the work will commence during the non-breeding season (September 1 – January 31).</td>
<td>City of Chico Planning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If construction is scheduled to occur within the nesting season (February 1 – August 31), the developer shall hire a qualified biologist to conduct a preconstruction survey of the project site to identify any active nests within 250 feet of the project area. The survey will be conducted no more than 7 days before the beginning of initial ground disturbances. If nesting raptors or migratory birds are found during the survey, impacts will be avoided by establishment of appropriate buffers. No construction activities will commence within the buffer area until a qualified biologist confirms that the nest is no longer active. California Department of Fish and Wildlife guidelines recommend implementation of 500 foot buffers around construction areas, but the size of the buffer may be adjusted if a qualified biologist determines that construction activities would not likely adversely affect the nest. Monitoring of the nest by a qualified biologist may be required if the activity has potential to adversely affect the nest. The migratory bird survey shall be conducted by a qualified, professional biologist.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mitigation Measure</th>
<th>Responsibility for Implementation</th>
<th>Mitigation Timing</th>
<th>Enforcement Responsibility</th>
<th>Verification of Compliance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>MM E.1 Cultural Resources</strong> A note shall be placed on all grading and construction plans which informs the construction contractor that if any bones, pottery fragments or other potential cultural resources are encountered during construction, all work shall cease within the area of the find pending an examination of the site and materials by a professional archaeologist. If during ground disturbing activities, any bones, pottery fragments or other potential cultural resources are encountered, the developer or their supervising contractor shall cease all work within the area of the find and notify Planning staff at (530) 879-6800. A professional archaeologist who meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Professional Qualification Standards for prehistoric and historic archaeology and who is familiar with the archaeological record of Butte County, shall be retained by the applicant to evaluate the significance of the find. Further, Planning staff shall notify all local tribes on the consultation list maintained by the State of California Native American Heritage Commission, to provide local tribes the opportunity to monitor evaluation of the site. Site work shall not resume until the archaeologist conducts sufficient research, testing and analysis of the archaeological evidence to make a determination that the resource is either not cultural in origin or not potentially significant. If a potentially significant resource is encountered, the archaeologist shall prepare a mitigation plan for review and approval by the Community Development Director, including recommendations for total data recovery, Tribal monitoring, disposition protocol, or avoidance, if applicable. All measures determined by the Community Development Director to be appropriate shall be implemented pursuant to the terms of the archaeologist’s report. The preceding requirement shall be incorporated into construction contracts and plans to ensure contractor knowledge and responsibility for proper implementation.</td>
<td>Project Applicant</td>
<td>Prior to issuance of grading or building permit.</td>
<td>City of Chico Planning staff will verify above wording is included on construction plans. Should cultural resources be encountered, the supervising contractor shall be responsible for reporting any such findings to Planning staff, and contacting a professional archaeologist, in consultation with Planning staff, to evaluate the find.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>