SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATION

The applicant is proposing to modify the commercial phase of a mixed-use development that was previously approved by the City Council and Planning Commission as part of the DeGarmo Terrace Subdivision and Planned Development Permit (S/PDP 07-11). Modifications to the site plan include relocating four buildings from the street frontages of The Esplanade and DeGarmo Drive to the project’s interior street, Bodero Lane, and reorganizing them around a central courtyard. Architectural style has been enlivened from a traditional strip-center motif to a Polynesian style (“Island Plantation”). For this proposal, the Board’s role is to provide a recommendation to the Planning Commission for final approval.

Proposed Motion

I move that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board recommend the Planning Commission adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and approve a Modification of Phase II of the DeGarmo Terrace Subdivision and Planned Development Permit (S/PDP 07-11) subject to the recommended conditions therein.

BACKGROUND AND DISCUSSION

The previously approved site plan was designed with four commercial buildings along the street frontages of DeGarmo Drive and The Esplanade, and a fifth building at Bodero Lane and The Esplanade. Consistent with design guidance in the Northwest Chico Specific Plan (NWCS), the approved site plan illustrates buildings close to streets and sidewalks in order to minimize views of parking areas and provide a pedestrian friendly shopping experience (see site location map, Attachment A, and previously approved site plan, Attachment B). The architectural design previously approved exhibits Mediterranean styling with varied roof lines, smooth stucco walls, and tile roofing (see previous elevations, Attachment C). While attractive, it was designed with a more strip-center approach offering more appeal to the adjacent streets, but less appeal to the residents of DeGarmo Terrace and other subdivisions adjacent to the west.

Proposed Site and Landscape Design

The proposed modification is designed with a lower scale (single-story) and a modified site
arrangement that relates to the adjacent residential units and reduces the linear strip-center appearance (see architect and landscape architect narrative statements, Attachments D, and E.) The modified site plan is designed with the new buildings addressing the opposite “corner” of the site where Bodero Lane bends in a 90-degree arc and intersects with the private road leading into the residential units of DeGarmo Terrace. The new buildings are located close to the Bodero Lane frontage and sidewalks and still providing consistency with the NWCSP design guidance. The architectural and landscape design, and related details, are illustrated in a packet of drawings, cumulatively provided as Attachment F (see itemized drawings noted at the end of this report).

While the revised site plan places parking areas towards The Esplanade and DeGarmo Drive street frontages, a 24-foot landscape buffer with earth berms topped with a low fence wall soften views of pavement and parked cars (see Architectural Site Plan, Sheet AO.2 and Preliminary Landscape Plan, Sheet L-1 in packet Attachment F). (Note that Building 46 on the north side of Bodero Drive remains in the originally approved location, close to The Esplanade.) A similar landscape buffer feature is provided along Bordero Drive, including a decorative retaining wall located between the street and Buildings 45 and 42. The proposed landscape plans support the Island Plantation theme incorporating three palm tree varieties, bamboo, and palm shrubs (see Plant List, Sheet L-2.) Decorative crosswalks provide pedestrian connections into the site from all streets which are clearly designated by arbors designed with consistent Polynesian styling. Decorative (lantern-style) parking lot pole lights match existing fixtures installed as part of the residential development of DeGarmo Terrace.

Proposed Architectural Design

In the architect’s project description (Attachment D), the revised site plan is described as a “cohesive village style” with architectural styling described as “Island Plantation”. Buildings are predominantly singe-story (20-foot height), although some tower elements that designate entries rise to 33-feet, offering interest with varied roof lines. Deep porch overhangs contribute to the “Island Plantation” architectural style, with low-slope hip roofs covered with green Spanish tile roofing (see elevations, Sheet A4 – A7 and perspective renderings A8 – A12). A material sample sheet is provided in Sheet A13 which notes exterior wall surfaces are sand finish plaster and specialty-textured plaster wainscot.

Conclusions

The proposal respects design policies regarding “sense of place” by utilizing single-story, low-slope roofs and green tile roofing material that blend well with views to the east and west of the Sierra Nevada foothills and the coastal mountains. The proposed modifications offer a refreshing architectural solution not implemented elsewhere in Chico and lend wayfinding characteristics to the project’s location on the north end of Chico. The Polynesian theme is consistent throughout all details of the project and should offer an attractive shopping and working environment for the surrounding residents, as well as a place for neighborhood social gathering, consistent with the purpose of the CN zoning district. The proposal meets the intent of a planned development required by Chapter 19.28 of the Chico Municipal Code by providing a project of greater quality and community benefit than otherwise with a conventional proposal.
RECOMMENDED DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. Discuss with the applicant sign parameters including letter height and methods of illumination. Staff recommends strict implementation of sign regulations for the CN zoning district including indirect lighting only or channel letters. Signs should be relatively understated in scale consistent with the intent of the CN district.

RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The front page of all approved building plans shall note in bold type face that the project shall comply with Modification of Phase II of DeGarmo Terrace Subdivision and Planned Development Permit (S/PDP 07-11). No building permits related to this approval shall be finaled without prior authorization of Community Development Department planning staff.

2. All development shall comply with all other State and local Code provisions, including those of the City of Chico Community Development and Public Works Departments. The permittee is responsible for contacting these offices to verify the need for compliance.

3. All building plans shall be consistent with the architectural plan set date stamped July 15, 2015 approved by the Architectural Review & Historic Preservation Board.

REQUIRED FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL

Environmental Review

The project has been determined to be categorically exempt under Section 1.40.220 of the Chico Municipal Code (CMC) and pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15332 (In-Fill Development Projects). The project has also been previously determined to be compliant with the Northwest Chico Specific Plan EIR which was certified at the time the specific plan was adopted. Since no new environmental impacts have been identified that were not contained and analyzed in the EIR, the project is exempt from further environmental.

Architectural Review

According to the Chico Municipal Code Section 19.18.060, the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board shall determine whether or not a project adequately meets adopted City standards and design guidelines based on the required findings itemized below.

1. The proposed development is consistent with the General Plan, any applicable specific plan, and any applicable neighborhood or area plans.

The project is consistent with the following goals and policies contained in the Community Design Element of the General Plan:

Goal CD-3: Ensure project design that reinforces a sense of place with context
sensitive elements and a human scale.

Policy CD-3.1 (Lasting Design and Materials) - Promote architectural design that exhibits timeless character and is constructed with high quality materials.

Goal CD-6: Enhance gateways and wayfinding elements for an improved sense of arrival and orientation for residents and visitors throughout Chico.

2. The proposed development, including the character, scale, and quality of design are consistent with the purpose/intent of this chapter and any adopted design guidelines.

Designed with a central courtyard, the proposal is consistent with the Design Objective from Chapter 1 of the Design Guidelines Manual, Section 1.1.3 - Public Spaces and Pedestrian Amenities:

Aesthetically integrate areas for safe public gathering, shelter, or rest in site design.

Designed with key pedestrian access features, the project is consistent with the Design Objective form Chapter 2, Section 2.1.2 Circulation and Vehicle Parking:

Support and provide design elements for safe and convenient movement of pedestrians, bicycles, and vehicles in shopping areas.

Similarly, the project is consistent with DG 2.1.21 – Include safe and convenient bicycle and pedestrian connections to nearby residential, commercial, and retail areas. Retrofit and remodel with such design features where feasible.

The "Island Plantation" style of architecture is clearly communicated in the architect's narrative statement consistent with DG 2.2.21 – Articulate a clear design concept in a written narrative statement to aid decision makers in understanding fundamental design elements of a project.

The unique roof design and deep overhangs are consistent with DG 2.2.24 - Incorporate roof design as an integral component of the architecture to enhance the overall aesthetics. When roof elements are exposed, treat as integral to all elevations.

The architectural style is clearly communicated throughout the building design consistent the Design Objective from Section 2.23 – Use building materials and colors that clearly support a project's overall design concept and style.

Similarly, the architectural forms, materials, and colors do not obscure or detract from the scenic beauty of vistas to the east and west of the site consistent with DG 2.2.34 – Avoid obscuring the scenic beauty of foothill and riparian backdrop locations with buildings that are oversized, extremely tall, or have materials or colors that draw attention from the natural view.

3. The architectural design of structures, including all elevations, materials and colors are visually compatible with surrounding development. Design elements, including
screening of equipment, exterior lighting, signs, and awnings, have been incorporated
into the project to further ensure its compatibility with the character and uses of adjacent
development.

All elevations consistently represent the "Island Plantation" style described in the
project narrative statement. Roof-mounted utilities are grouped and screened inside a
roof well on each building. Exterior lighting and awnings are consistent throughout the
development and compatible with the existing residential component of the DeGarmo
Terraces neighborhood.

4. The location and configuration of structures are compatible with their sites and with
surrounding sites and structures, and do not unnecessarily block views from other
structures or dominate their surroundings.

The predominant single-story design does not dominate or block views of adjacent
residential structures or natural vistas.

5. The general landscape design, including the color, location, size, texture, type, and
coverage of plant materials, and provisions for irrigation and maintenance, and
protection of landscape elements, have been considered to ensure visual relief, to
complement structures, and to provide an attractive environment.

The landscape plan reinforces the Polynesian design concept throughout with
ornamental palm trees and shrubs. Plantings screen utilities and parking areas. The
central landscaped courtyard provides visual relief and a welcoming environment for
social gathering.

PUBLIC CONTACT

Public notice requirements were fulfilled by placing a notice on the project site and by posting
of the agenda at least 10 days prior to this ARHPB meeting.

ATTACHMENTS
A. Location Map
B. Previously approved site plan
C. Previously approved elevations
D. Architect's narrative statement
E. Landscape architect's narrative statement
F. Architectural drawing packet

DISTRIBUTION
Internal (3)
Mark Wolfe, Community Development Director
Bob Summerville, Senior Planner
File: Modification of DeGarmo Terrace (S/PDP 07-11)
External (6)
NM&R Architects, attn.: David Rogers, 555 Main Street, Suite 300, Chico, CA 95928
Brian Firth Landscape Architect, Inc., 627 Broadway, Suite 220, Chico, CA 95928
Paul Leete, attn.: Montecito Investment Group LLC, 40 Bellarmine Court, Chico, CA 95928
DeGarmo Terrace Subdivision and Planned Development Permit (S/PDP 07-11)
Phase II Modification
APN 006-820-013-000

G:\GIS\DEPARTMENTS\PLANNING\plots\subdivisions\nwcsp\degarmoterr_ph2modification.pdf

ATTACHMENT A
Previously Approved Elevations
Previously Approved Elevations
July 15, 2015

Mr. Bob Summerville, Senior Planner
City of Chico Planning Dept.
P.O. Box 3420
Chico, CA 95927

RE: Project Description for ARHPB submittal
DeGarmo Terrace - Phase 2

Dear Mr. Summerville,

DeGarmo Terrace is a mixed-use Planned Development project located on the Esplanade within the Northwest Chico specific plan. Phase 1, which consists of 2-story residential units, was completed in 2014. The proposed Phase 2 development consists of 5 separate 1-story commercial buildings containing approximately 25,000 square feet. The anticipated use will be a mixture of retail, restaurant and professional office.

The site layout of the commercial buildings, as shown in our submittal package, differs from the layout approved by the Planning Commission as part of the Planned Development Permit (07-11). The number of buildings and their sizes have remained the same. The difference is that four of the buildings are now shown arranged around a common courtyard instead of being lined up along the two street frontages. The layout of the fifth building (Lot 46) remains unchanged. We believe this new layout provides a better opportunity for the commercial success of the project by providing a larger central courtyard where more business have direct access. The relocation of the parking lot to the opposite side of the site also benefits the Phase 1 residential units by locating the businesses closer and the commercial traffic farther away. The proposed building design has been scaled down to better fit the scale of the adjacent residential development. The architectural style has been revised from a typical strip-center motif to more of a cohesive village style. We are calling the style "Island Plantation" as the inspiration for the exterior design came from our client's recent trip to the Big Island.

Thank you for your thoughtful consideration.

David Rogers, Principal Architect
Nichols, Melburg & Rossetto
July 15, 2015

City of Chico Planning Department  
411 Main Street  
Chico, CA 95928

Project Description- Landscape  
Degarmo Terrace  
Chico, California

The landscaping and site design for this project facilitates the mixed use of the site. Elevation changes, stairs, the large courtyard space, trellises, container plantings, and lighting all combine to act as a draw for a dynamic office/restaurant combination.

Special attention has been paid to the layout of the trees to provide maximum shade during summer afternoons and early evenings.

It is the goal of this project to propose street furniture and outdoor materials to be complimentary to the style of the building. This includes, but is not limited to: ceramic glazed planting containers, concrete ash urns, concrete trash receptacles, concrete benches, and bike racks.

Pedestrian needs have been programmed into the site, including raised pedestrian ramp at drive aisles and parking lot islands dedicated for pedestrian access  (DG 1.1.31)

The layout of the buildings creates a courtyard that facilitates pedestrian use and interaction.  (DG 1.1.32)

The courtyard has been designed with seating, specialty paving, and landscaping to further facilitate pedestrian interaction.  (DG 1.1.33)

Tables chairs, pedestrian scale lighting specialty paving all reinforce sense of place,  (DG 1.1.34)

Parking lot lighting pole height is 15 feet, below mature tree height, and is integrated into planting design such that they are placed between trees and are full cutoff at the perimeter.  (DG 1.5.12, 1.5.13, 1.5.15)

There is a dedicated, interior bicycle linkage to the subdivision to the west.  (DG 2.1.21)

Landscape Architecture . Site Planning . Park Design
There are several raised pedestrian decks interior to the parking lot to match what was installed on Bodrero Drive that act to slow traffic and highly identifiable pedestrian crossings. (DG 2.1.23)

parking has been screened with both shrub plantings, intermittent low walls and berming. (DG 2.1.25)

Street trees have been integrated into the design along the Esplanade and Degarmo Drive. (DG 2.1.28)

Bicycle parking is placed close to the building entrance (DG 2.1.32)

The trash enclosure has landscape planters on 3 sides with shrub plantings to buffer the trash enclosure (DG 2.1.36).
TOTAL LANDSCAPE AREA

THE TOTAL LANDSCAPE AREA FOR THIS PROJECT IS 24,895 SF

WATER USE CALCULATIONS

Medium Applied Water: Allowance (MRAW) - Calculation

Medium = # GALS/HR (A) 

MRAW = SPOT irrigated area 

ksi = 650,000 / 25 

Medium = 650,000 gallons per year

CHECK BOX

DESCRIPTION

SYMBOL

PLANTING PLAN WITH LEGEND

STATEMENT AS TO DOWNSPOUT TYPE AND ANY SPECIAL PLANTING TECHNIQUES REQUIRED.

TREES TO REMAIN OR BE MACHINED. (CHECK)

FENCE WALL LOCATIONS, HEIGHTS, DESIGNS

HARDCORE FEATURES AND MATERIALS

EXTERIOR LIGHTING. LOCATION HEIGHT, DESIGN, TYPE OF LAMP, AND INTENSITY. SEE ARCHITECTS' PLANS FOR BUILDING LIGHTS.

SCREENING METHODS FOR TRASH DUMPSTERS, MECHANICAL, EQUIPMENT, AND PARKING AREAS. SEE ARCHITECTS' PLANS FOR ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.

PERCENTAGE OF PAVEMENT SHADING IN PARKING AREA (MINIMUM OF 50%).

OUTDOOR PATIO/MEETING AREA

AB 1187 CONCEPTUAL / CONCEPTUAL HYDROZONES AND IRRIGATION METHODS

CONCRETE TRASH/ RECYCLING BIN & ASH URN

BOLLARD LIGHT

Palm TREE LIGHT RINGS

DEGARMO TERRACE
COMMERCIAL BUILDINGS
PRELIMINARY LANDSCAPE PLAN

PREPARED FOR:
MONTECITO INVESTMENT GROUP
21 DEGARMO COURT
CHICO, CA 95928

NORTH
SOUTH
WATER USE

CONCRETE BENCH

TREE GRATE AND GUARD

GLAZED PLANTING CONTAINER

BICYCLE RACK