DATE:       June 10, 2019

TO:      Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board

FROM:    Shannon Costa, Associate Planner, (879-6807, shannon.costa@chicoca.gov)
          Community Development Department

RE:      Mangrove Commercial (AR 19-13), 1030 Mangrove Avenue, APN 003-220-051

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and approve the proposed project, subject to the recommended conditions.

Proposed Motion

I move that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and approve Architectural Review 19-13 (Mangrove Commercial), subject to the recommended conditions.

BACKGROUND

The applicant proposes to construct a new two story, mixed use commercial building. The site is located on the east side of Mangrove Avenue, approximately 415-feet south of the intersection of Mangrove Avenue and E. 1st Avenue (see Attachment A, Location Map and Attachment B, Site Plan). The site is zoned CC-COS (Community Commercial with Corridor Opportunity Site) and is designated Commercial Mixed Use by the General Plan.

The proposed development includes demolition of the existing commercial building and reconstruction of a new building within the same footprint. The drive-through facility is an existing, allowed use, authorized under a previously-approved use permit. The drive-through use would maintain compliance with all previously imposed conditions of approval and the approved site plan.

DISCUSSION

The proposed building would be 7,000 square feet in size, and includes space for restaurant, retail and office uses (see Attachment C, Project Description). The proposal would utilize many of the existing site improvements, including vehicle parking and access, trash enclosure, and site lighting.

The site plan situates the building at the middle of the site, separated from the public right-of-way by the drive-through aisle and landscaping planter. The site is accessed by two entry points from Mangrove Avenue, each shared by adjacent uses. A total of 35 vehicle parking spaces are provided on site, satisfying the minimum parking requirement for the proposed mix of uses. Two inverted-U bike racks would be installed between the building and the public right-of-way. The frame of an existing ground-mounted sign is located near the front property line and appears to exceed the allowable height for ground-mounted signs in the CC
zoning district. A condition of approval is recommended (see Condition of Approval #5) that the existing sign frame be removed, and that all new signage shall comply with CMC 19.74 (Signs).

The proposed elevations exhibit an agrarian architectural design including board-and-batten siding, standing seam metal roof and single-hung second story windows (see Attachment D, Elevations). The building would be rectangular in shape and reach 32-feet at the highest point. The southerly building elevation would feature a gable roof while the northerly elevation would feature both a flat roof and gable roof. The building’s exterior finish would be black-brown (“Black Fox”) with white trim (“Cloud White”). The metal roof would be dark bronze (“Dark Bronze”) and aluminum window systems would be red (“Redwood”) (see Attachment E, Colors and Materials). Sloped metal awnings are proposed over storefront entries and a flat metal awning would provide cover at the drive-through window. An existing trash enclosure is located in the northwesterly corner of the site, and a condition of approval is recommended (see Condition of Approval #6) that the enclosure be painted to match the main building. White gooseneck wall-mounted light fixtures are proposed at various locations around the building. Existing parking lot light poles would be retrofitted with LED fixtures to illuminate the customer parking area (see Attachment F, Photometrics Plan).

The landscape plans call for improvements to existing landscape planters, including extensive screening for the drive-through aisle (see Attachment G, Landscape Plan). Plantings would be a mix of low to medium water demand, including shrubs, grasses and groundcover. Three trees are identified for removal, including two liquid amber trees and one celtis tree. All tree removal is subject to the City’s Tree Preservation Regulations (CMC 16.66), including A total of 25 new trees would be planted on site, including Chinese pistache and Canary Island pine. A variety of tree species would provide shade for the vehicle parking area, which is estimated to reach 55-percent at full tree maturity.

**ANALYSIS**

The project proposes a revitalization of an existing blighted property in the Mangrove Avenue Corridor Opportunity Site. The proposed project would implement General Plan goals and policies that support intensifying and redeveloping opportunity sites. The proposal is consistent with several General Plan policies, including those that encourage compatible infill development (LU-5.1, LU-2.4 and LU-4) and encourage positive neighborhood contributions (LU-4.4). The project is also consistent with goals and policies to enhance Chico’s long-term prosperity (ED-1) and ensure that regulations and permitting processes for the conduct of commerce do not unreasonably inhibit local business activity (ED-1.3). Using the existing access driveways is consistent with policy CIRC-1.1 which calls for minimizing new driveways on larger streets.

As mentioned, the proposal utilizes the existing drive-through layout of the site, limiting the orientation and scale of the new building. Because of that, the building is challenged by Design Guidelines (DGs) that call for varied building depth to avoid long, unarticulated elevations, as seen on the building’s northerly elevation. Design Guideline consistency is ultimately achieved through scale and character that does not overwhelm the surrounding neighborhood, enhanced landscaping, and minimizing views of parking areas from the public right-of-way (DG 1.2.13, 1.1.14, 2.1.25, 2.1.26 and 2.1.27). Covered storefront entries create a sense of focus so people may easily find the entrance (DG 2.2.23) and building materials
reinforce a sense of permanence, history and place (DG 1.2.32). Roof-mounted HVAC systems are hidden from public view within parapet walls (DG 2.2.28) and safe and convenient bicycle and pedestrian connections are provided (DG 2.1.21). For additional DG consistency analysis, see the applicant's project description, Attachment B.

REQUIRED FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL

Environmental Review

This project is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15302 (Replacement of Reconstruction). Consistent with this exemption, the project involves the replacement of and existing commercial structure with a new structure of substantially the same size, purpose and capacity, located on the same site as the previous structure.

Architectural Review

According to the Chico Municipal Code Section 19.18.060, the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board shall determine whether or not a project adequately meets adopted City standards and design guidelines, based upon the following findings:

1. **The proposed development is consistent with the General Plan, any applicable specific plan, and any applicable neighborhood or area plans.**

   The project proposes a revitalization of an existing blighted property in the Mangrove Avenue Corridor Opportunity Site. Opportunity Sites are identified in the General Plan as areas expected to be the focus of change and revitalization. The proposed project would implement General Plan goals and policies that support intensifying and redeveloping opportunity sites. The proposal is consistent with several General Plan policies, including those that encourage compatible infill development (LU-5.1, LU-2.4 and LU-4) and encourage positive neighborhood contributions (LU-4.4). The project is also consistent with goals and policies to enhance Chico’s long-term prosperity (ED-1) and ensure that regulations and permitting processes for the conduct of commerce do not unreasonably inhibit local business activity (ED-1.3). Using the existing access driveways is consistent with policy CIRC-1.1 which calls for minimizing new driveways on larger streets.

2. **The proposed development, including the character, scale, and quality of design are consistent with the purpose/intent of this chapter and any adopted design guidelines.**

   The purpose and intent of CMC 19.18 (Site Design and Architectural Review) is to promote the general health, safety, welfare and economy of residents in the community through orderly harmonious development, enhancing the desirability of residence or investment in the City and to promote visual environments that are of high aesthetic quality and variety. Design Guideline consistency is achieved through enhanced landscaping and building placement, minimizing views of parking areas from the public right-of-way (DG 1.1.14, 2.1.25, 2.1.26 and 2.1.27). The proposed building is of a size and scale that does not overwhelm the surrounding neighborhood (DG 1.2.13), and covered storefront entries create a sense of focus so people may easily find the entrance (DG 2.2.23). Roof-mounted HVAC systems are hidden from public view within parapet walls (DG 2.2.28) and safe and convenient bicycle and pedestrian connections are
provided (DG 2.1.21). Overall, the proposed project is consistent with the purpose and intent of CMC 19.18.

3. The architectural design of structures, including all elevations, materials and colors are visually compatible with surrounding development. Design elements, including screening of equipment, exterior lighting, signs, and awnings, have been incorporated into the project to further ensure its compatibility with the character and uses of adjacent development.

The design, materials and colors of the proposed new building are visually compatible with surrounding commercial development and would provide much needed enhancement to the Mangrove Avenue corridor. Exterior equipment will be properly screened from view by roof parapets, landscaping or painted to match approved colors. The project utilizes site improvements that have existing compatibly at this location for many years, including site lighting, access and landscape planters.

4. The location and configuration of structures are compatible with their sites and with surrounding sites and structures, and do not unnecessarily block views from other structures or dominate their surroundings.

The location and configuration of the proposed structure is compatible with existing surrounding uses. The building would occupy the same footprint as the previous development and would not unnecessarily block views or dominate its surroundings. The drive through lane will be adequately screened by new and existing landscaping.

5. The general landscape design, including the color, location, size, texture, type, and coverage of plant materials, and provisions for irrigation and maintenance, and protection of landscape elements, have been considered to ensure visual relief, to complement structures, and to provide an attractive environment.

The proposed landscaping will provide visual relief around the new building and would provide much-needed landscape improvements to the site. Particular attention is paid to the drive-through aisle, and new trees would shade the existing parking area. The proposed landscape would provide an attractive environment to an existing blighted building.

RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. All approved building plans and permits shall note on the cover sheet that the project shall comply with AR 19-13 (Mangrove Commercial). No building permits related to this approval shall be finaled without authorization of Planning staff.

2. The proposed landscape plan may be modified as necessary to comply with Low Impact Development (LID) requirements, as promulgated under Chico Municipal Code Section 15.50.

3. All wall-mounted utilities and roof or wall penetrations, including vent stacks, utility boxes, exhaust vents, gas meters and similar equipment, shall be screened by appropriate materials and colors. Adequate screening shall be verified by planning
staff prior to issuance of a certificate of occupancy.

4. All new electric, telephone, and other wiring conduits for utilities shall be placed underground in compliance with CMC 19.60.120.

5. The existing ground-mounted sign frame shall be removed, and all new signage shall be permitted through a separate sign permit in compliance with CMC 19.74 (Signs).

6. The existing trash enclosure shall be painted to match the main structure.

7. As required by CMC 16.66, trees removed shall be replaced as follows:

   a. On-site. For every six inches in DBH removed, a new 15 gallon tree shall be planted on-site. Replacement trees shall be of similar species, unless otherwise approved by the urban forest manager, and shall be placed in areas dedicated for tree plantings. New plantings’ survival shall be ensured for three years after the date of planting and shall be verified by the applicant upon request by the director. If any replacement trees die or fail within the first three years of their planting, then the applicant shall pay an in-lieu fee as established by a fee schedule adopted by the City Council.

   b. Off-site. If it is not feasible or desirable to plant replacement trees on-site, payment of an in-lieu fee as established by a fee schedule adopted by the City Council shall be required.

   c. Replacement trees shall not receive credit as satisfying shade or street tree requirements otherwise mandated by the municipal code.

   d. Tree removal shall be subject to the in-lieu fee payment requirements set forth by Chico Municipal Code (CMC) 16.66 and fee schedule adopted by the City Council.

   e. All trees not approved for removal shall be preserved on and adjacent to the project site. A tree preservation plan, including fencing around drip lines and methods for excavation within the drip lines of protected trees to be preserved shall be prepared by the project developer pursuant to CMC 16.66.110 and 19.68.060 for review and approval by planning staff prior to any ground-disturbing activities.

PUBLIC CONTACT

A 10-day public hearing notice was mailed to all landowners and residents within 500 feet of the site, a legal notice was published in the Chico Enterprise Record and a notice was posted on the project site at least 10 days prior to this ARHPB meeting. As of the date of this report no comments have been received in response to the public notice.

ATTACHMENTS

A. Location Map
B. Site Plan  
C. Project Description  
D. Elevations  
E. Colors and Materials  
F. Photometrics Plan  
G. Landscape Plans  

**DISTRIBUTION**  
Internal (3)  
Mike Sawley, Senior Planner  
Shannon Costa, Associate Planner  
Files: AR 19-13 (Mangrove Commercial)  

External  
Scott Gibson, email: scottg@sgarchitect.net  
Pacific Property Group, email: kent@pacificpropertiesgroup.com 

X:\Current Planning\AR\2019\13 Mangrove Commercial\for ARB\ARHPB 19-13 Staff Report.doc
AR 19-13 (Mangrove Commercial)
1030 Mangrove Avenue
APN 003-220-051-000
**SUMMARY:**

**SITE DATA**

- **APN:** 03R-230-351-000
- **LOCATION:** 1030 Mangrove Ave
- **LAND (AC):** 26,728.0 SF (0.61 ACRES)
- **BUILD AREA (SF):** 2,030 SF
- **PROPOSED BUILDING:** 2,030 SF

| TOTAL | LAND / BLDG | 2,030 SF
| LAND / BLDG | 2,030 SF

**BUILDING DATA:**

- **PARKING REQUIRED TENANT:**
  - SUITE A (GROUND)
    - 2,200 SF
  - SUITE (GROUND)
    - 234 SF (1.04 PER 1,000 SF)
  - SUITE B (METAL)
    - 837 SF
  - SUITE C (erville)
    - 3,134 SF

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ELEVATOR / MACH Rm / STAIR / LOBBY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>824 SF</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PARKING DATA**

- **PARKING SITE:
  - STANDARD: 49'x50' (14 W/20 M)
  - COMPACT: 49'x15' (14 W/20 M)

- **PARKING BASIS:
  - OFFICE (BASICS): 2.06 SF PER 1,000 SF
  - RESTAURANT / BAR / RETAIL: 4 SF PER 1,000 SF

| REGULAR ACCESSIBLE STALLS | 1 |
| VAN ACCESSIBLE STALLS | 1 |

**BIKE RACKS DATA**

- **BIKE RACKS (TOTAL):**
  - SHORT-TERM: 5 X 5 STALLS
  - BIKE RACKS (TOTAL): 2 STALLS

**KEYED NOTES**

- **(1) BIKE RACK (front)
  - (2) TRASH HIDEURE
  - (3) HANDWASH STATION
  - (4) LANDSCAPE PLANTER
  - (5) PARKING (in red)
  - (6) PARKING (in white)

**PROPOSED 2 STORY BUILDING 1,000 SF**

**SUITES:**

- **SUITE A:** 2,000 SF
- **SUITE B:** 2,000 SF
- **SUITE C:** 3,134 SF

**NOT A PART**

**MANGROVE AVE**
May 6th, 2019

Plan Reviewer
City of Chico ~ Planning Services Dept.
POB 3420
Chico, CA 95927

Re: 1030 Mangrove Avenue
Chico, California 95926

To whom it may concern.

We are pleased to submit the design documents for the proposed rebuild, a mixed-use building, located at 1030 Mangrove Avenue.

Introduction:
This will be a two (2) story, Mixed-Use Building, comprised of the following uses and areas:

1. Quick Service Restaurant (QSR)- First Floor only (with existing Drive-Thru lane)
2. Retail/Commercial – First Floor only
3. Office/Professional – Second Floor

Land Use Designations:
1. General Plan: CMU ~ COMMERCIAL MIXED USE (Corridor overlay: Mangrove Ave.)
2. Zoning: CC ~ COMMUNITY COMMERCIAL
3. Assessors Parcel Numbers: 003-200-051-000

Building Areas:
1. Ground Floor:
   a. QSR 2,200 sq.ft.
   b. Retail/Commercial 837 sq.ft.
   c. Lobby/Stairs Elevator 463 sq.ft.
   d. Total Ground Floor 3,500 sq.ft.
2. Second Floor: Office
   a. Office/Professional 3,134 sq.ft.
   b. Lobby/Stairs Elevator 366 sq.ft.
3. TOTAL BUILDING AREA 7,000 sq.ft.

Architectural Design:
The façade has a contemporary agrarian themed design, with a varied widths of standing seam roof to create a random almost "wood grained" look to the roof & shed canopies. The façade is clad with Board and Batt siding. The color palette features primary building colors for the walls and roof that are

Attachment C
Architectural Design continued

very rich, dark colors, with white trim accents to create contrast. The storefronts are a rich red color.

We believe that this design will evoke a connection to the agricultural heritage of the Chico community. The building is also accented with white gooseneck lamps that will shine down and will wash the walls with accent lighting. We propose an outdoor patio along the west side of the building to front Mangrove Avenue.

Metal awnings canopies are used throughout the façade entrances and along the pedestrian pathway to provide shade and interesting play of light & shadow.

Rooftop equipment will be fully screened from off-site views by the building’s parapet walls and architectural screening as required.

Our intention is to create sight lines that facilitate an attractive and inviting presentation to the streets - for both pedestrians and vehicular traffic. We look to develop a high quality building with a simplified edifice with a sophisticated architectural style which complements Chico’s visual character.

City of Chico DESIGN GUIDELINES:

Chapters 1 & 2 of The City of Chico Design Guidelines Manual were extensively utilized throughout the design process:

- The combinations of colors and building materials such as Board & Batt sheathing, Standing Seam Metal Roof & Canopies and Goose-Neck Lights were selected to complement existing aesthetics in the immediate vicinity, but also reinforce a sense of permanence. [DG 1.1.1, 1.2.13, 1.2.21, 1.2.32]

- Outdoor patios will reinforce a pedestrian-friendly environment by adding outdoor sitting areas all with nearby bicycle parking. [DG 1.1.13]

- The proposed landscape design softens and screen views from the public right-of-way towards the building frontage with multilayered, varied and articulated spaces. [DG 1.1.14, 2.1.26, 2.1.27]

- The patio is situated on the west side of the building which will allows various levels of interaction to the street. [DG 1.1.15]

- Decorative paving is utilized to define pedestrian gathering areas [DG 1.1.33]

- The well-lit site layout enhances safety, security, and surveillance [DG 1.1.35]

- Decorative goose-neck style building lights in addition to recessed under-awning lights provide effective, aesthetic lighting while minimizing glare [DG 1.5.1]

- Shade trees and energy-efficient fixtures are utilized to minimize wasted energy in all 4 seasons. The west elevation is well shaded from mature shade trees. [DG 1.7.1]

- Shop and Restaurant tenants will be consulted throughout the design process to ensure the tenant inffills meets both their requirements while also embracing Chico’s visual character. [DG 1.8.1]
City of Chico DESIGN GUIDELINES continued

- Varied rooflines add character and style to the building so as to reinforce the sense of place. [DG 1.2.22]

- The bicycle racks are placed in close proximity to the building entrances and provide shade so as to comply with sections [DG 2.1.21, 2.1.31 2.1.32].

- Building design complements surrounding architecture while also taking on its own unique identity by utilizing building materials such as Board & Batt sheathing, Standing Seam Metal Roof & Canopies and Goose-Neck Lights. [DG 2.2.1]

- Building materials, colors, and awnings at the façade create a sense of focus at building entrances and avoid monotony. [DG 2.2.2 & 2.2.3]

- Trash Enclosures are placed behind the building, all utility structures will be screened with landscape planting [DG 3.1.35]

- Building elevations are articulated in height, setback and color finishes to create varied building depth and shadow. [DG 3.2.22]

Compatibility:

The proposed project would provide the following mitigations:
1. All HVAC units will be completely screened from view with high parapets
2. Outdoor public patios and business entrance shall be located street side(s) of the building.
3. Trash enclosures shall be placed to the rear of the building in the interior parking areas.
4. All Site and Street trees and plantings shall be drought tolerant and meet the approval of the City of Chico Forester.

S.G.A. – SCOTT GIBSON ARCHITECT, Inc.

[Signature]
Scott G. Gibson
California License C18327
Refer to sheet A. for typical elevation keyed notes.

South (Front) Elevation 1

North (Rear) Elevation 2

Proposed Exterior Elevations

SCALE: 1/8"=1'-0"

Attachment D
**BIKE RACK**

B1  BIKE RACK
MFR: HIGHLAND
SPEC: 145.1438 STANDARD STYLE BIKE RACK
COLOR: BLACK

**LIGHTING**

L1  ALUMINUM GOOSENECK WALL LIGHT
MFR: TROY RLM
MODEL: 15N76

**COLORS**

P1  SHERWIN WILLIAMS SW7020 - BLACK FOX
P2  BENJAMIN MOORE OC-132 - CLOUD WHITE
P3  SHERWIN WILLIAMS SW0467 - PORCUPINE

NOTES: ALL EXTERIOR PAINT ACRYLIC LATEX, FLAT SHEEN
BLACK PAINT TO BE SATIN SHEEN

**STOREFRONT SYSTEM**

SF1  ANODIZED ALUMINUM STOREFRONT
MFR: OLD CASTLE SYSTEM IN REDWOOD 394F125

**MATERIALS**

BB1  BOARD AND BATTEN
MFR: JAMES HARDIE
SERIES: FIBER CEMENT SIDING
COLOR: PAINTED P1

SS1  STANDING SEAM METAL ROOF
(ALTERNATING WIDTHS 12", 15", & 18")
MFR: METAL SALES
COLOR: DARK BRONZE (50)

**SINGLE HUNG VINYL WINDOWS**

W1  WINDOWS
MFR: PELLA SINGLE HUNG WINDOWS IN REDWOOD

**COLORS**

P1  P2  P3

**MATERIALS**

BB1  DARK BRONZE (50)

SS1  REDWOOD 394F125