DATE: January 10, 2017

TO: Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board

FROM: Mike Sawley, Senior Planner, (879-6812, mike.sawley@chicoca.gov)
Community Development Department

RE: Design of Single-family Homes for the Crossroads Subdivision
2821 Cactus Avenue, APN 016-120-036

REPORT IN BRIEF

The applicant requests that the Board forward a recommendation of approval to the Planning Commission for the design of single-family homes within a 13-lot subdivision and planned development. With a Board recommendation, the proposal must go to the Planning Commission for final consideration of the subdivision map and planned development permit, including final architectural design approval.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and recommend approval of the project, subject to conditions.

Proposed Motion

I move that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and recommend approval of the Crossroads Subdivision (S/PDP 16-02), subject to conditions.

BACKGROUND

The proposed project is located on the west side of Cactus Avenue, between Kinswood Lane and Rusty Lane (see Attachment A). The project includes a Subdivision and Planned Development Permit (S/PDP) to divide the site into 13 lots for single-family residential use (see Attachments B, C, and D).

The site is designated Low Density Residential on the General Plan diagram and zoned R1-AOC-SD7 (Low Density Residential, 2.1 to 7 units/acre, with Aircraft Operations Zone C and Special Design Considerations #7 Cactus Avenue overlay districts). Surrounding land uses include single-family residential.

Subdivision Design
The proposed subdivision calls for the construction of a new public street extending west from Cactus Avenue approximately 450 feet (Road A), intersecting another new street oriented parallel to Cactus Avenue (Road B). The northerly end of Road B would terminate in a cul-de-sac bulb and the southerly end of Road B would be temporarily dead-ended,
available for potential future extension into the large property located south. The existing residence and outbuildings at the site would be removed.

A variety of lot sizes are proposed, ranging from 6,000 square feet (sf) to over 14,000 sf. Lot 4 would not meet the minimum required width of 45 feet at the front setback line and is therefore considered an infill residential flag lot. The average lot size is approximately 9,000 sf and the subdivision would result in a gross density of 3.5 units per acre.

Requested Subdivision Design Modifications
Modifications of Title 18R Subdivision Design Criteria and Improvement Standards include:

1) Non-radial side lot lines on Lots 1 through 6 (side lot lines are generally parallel to one another rather than strictly perpendicular to the street),

2) Non-standard street section to omit sidewalk along the south side of Road A adjacent to the subdivision boundary,

3) Cul-de-sac length greater than 500 feet, and

4) Non-standard lot width at front setback line for Lot 4.

Residential Development
Thirteen new, single-story, single-family residences would be constructed along the new streets developed within the site. The building pad areas for each lot are shown on the Open Space Exhibit (Attachment D). Each of the residences would have a two- or three-car garage, and at least two off-street parking spaces located in front of the garage.

Development of Lots 12 and 13 would necessitate removal of two existing trees on the site, which is subject to municipal code requirements regarding tree replacement and would require payment of in-lieu fees for a total of eight replacement trees.

Architecture proposed for the residences is single-story, stucco with a variety of rooflines and front porch configurations (see Attachment E, Elevations and Attachment F, Colors and Materials). Front elevations would feature decorative elements such as cultured stone veneer, stucco window trim, sidelight/transom windows, and garage doors painted to match the residence. The side and rear elevations of the residences would have simpler design elements.

Five example home designs are provided along with additional options for the garage doors (see Attachments G). It is proposed that feature selections be left for future home buyers to choose, with the caveat that no two identical elevations would repeat adjacent to one another. Exterior lighting for the new homes would consist of typical low-intensity fixtures mounted near entryways (see Attachment H).

Typical front yard landscaping plans show a variety of trees, drought-tolerant shrubs, and groundcover arranged with non-living landscape elements such as fieldstone boulders and dry creek bed features (see Attachment I). Rear yards would be left to the homeowner to landscape.

Fencing around the new homes would be typical, solid 6-foot cedar with board and batten top rail. A combination of split-rail fencing and solid wall is proposed along the southerly side of
Road A to provide separation from existing uses to the south. Example are provided in Attachment J, and the proposed extent of each type of fencing is shown on the tentative map, Attachment C.

**Neighborhood Meeting**

A neighborhood meeting was held near the project site on 06/02/16 and the applicant presented a prior version of the tentative map showing 15 lots and a different street configuration. The meeting was attended by approximately 15 neighbors as well as City staff. Concerns were raised by the neighbors at the meeting, particularly with regard to increased traffic on Cactus Avenue and potential disturbance of the active horse ranch located immediately south of the project.

The developer redesigned the project to arrive at the current 13-lot layout and added the proposed fence/wall along the southerly boundary in an effort to provide effective separation from the horse ranch. A complete list of the major changes made to the project at that time is included as Attachment K.

A second neighborhood meeting was held on 08/30/16 to review the current project design and approximately 10 neighbors were in attendance. The applicant presented the changes and answered several questions regarding the project. Concerns remained over increased traffic from the project and the potential that future residential activity from the project will excessively disturb the horses kept on property located south of the site.

**DISCUSSION**

Pursuant to Chico Municipal Code (CMC) section 19.28.050, Planned Development Permit applications require review by the Board, which shall forward a recommendation to the Planning Commission regarding the site design and proposed architecture.

The proposed infill project would establish residential density at the site consistent with the R1 zoning and Low-Density Residential General Plan Designation. Utilizing larger lots with single-story construction and greater setbacks for the new single-family residences balances General Plan policies that encourage compatible infill development (LU-4.2 and LU-4.3), and context-sensitive design (CD-5.2 and CD-5.3). The new public street would provide for future connectivity into under-developed adjacent areas, consistent with CIRC-2.2.1.

The project design is consist with several Design Guidelines (DGs), including those that encourage a variety of home designs that include front porches and windows that face the street, consistent with DGs 4.1.11 and 4.1.14. Additional Design Guideline discussion is provided by the applicant in Attachment C.

**Zoning Overlay - Special Design Considerations #7 (Cactus Avenue)**

The SD-7 overlay zoning district applies several design standards and requirements for proposed subdivisions located along Cactus Avenue. Each of these requirements are listed below, followed by a brief staff analysis:

1) *Street connectivity shall be provided between developments consistent with Community Design Element policies of the General Plan, including provisions for connections to Cactus Avenue and Arch Way. Vehicular access onto Cactus Avenue*
shall only be allowed at such time that Cactus Avenue is improved between the access point to Cactus Avenue and East Avenue.

Staff Analysis: The proposed subdivision provides for a future street extension into the large, under-developed property located south of the Road B, Scooter Lane (located to the west), and Rusty Lane (located north of the site) are private roadways maintained by the adjoining property owners. It is not practicable to create additional public street connections to either of these private roadways.

As a result of other subdivisions constructed (or currently under construction) along Cactus Avenue, the street is considered to be minimally improved between the proposed new access point and East Avenue.

2) Lots fronting Cactus Avenue shall have a minimum lot size of 10,000 square feet.

Staff Analysis: Proposed Lot 13 is 12,373 sf, meeting this standard.

3) Homes fronting Cactus Avenue shall be oriented to face Cactus Avenue and may have driveways onto Cactus Avenue.

Staff Analysis: The proposed home on Lot 13 would face Cactus Avenue, meeting this standard.

4) Buildings on parcels fronting Eaton Road shall face Eaton Road, unless otherwise provided by Planned Development Permit, and shall address potential noise concerns with measures that avoid the use of sound walls.

Staff Analysis: Not applicable, the project site does not front on Eaton Road.

5) Low-level street lighting shall be utilized to maintain the rural atmosphere of the area.

Staff Analysis: City standard 18-ft tall arched inverted lantern (aka "candy cane") style street lighting is proposed, similar to existing street lights installed as part of other recent subdivisions along Cactus Avenue.

6) All future subdivision applications shall require a Planned Development Permit.

Staff Analysis: The proposal includes a PDP application to satisfy this requirement, no deviations from typical development regulations are requested as part of the PDP.

REQUIRED FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL

Environmental Review

This project is categorically exempt from environmental review pursuant to Section 15332 of the California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines (Infill Development Projects). This exemption applies to infill projects which: are consistent with the general plan and zoning; are on sites less than five acres in size within the City limits; substantially surrounded by urban uses; have no value as habitat for endangered, rare, or threatened species; would not result in any significant effects relating to traffic, noise, air quality, or water quality; and can be adequately served by all utilities and public services. The project meets all these criteria.
Architectural Review

According to the Chico Municipal Code Section 19.18.060, the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board shall determine whether or not a project adequately meets adopted City standards and design guidelines, based upon the following findings:

1. **The proposed development is consistent with the General Plan, any applicable specific plan, and any applicable neighborhood or area plans.**

   At 3.5 units per acre the proposal falls within the density range for the R1 zoning and Low Density Residential General Plan Designation (2.1 to 7 units per acre). Limiting construction to single-story, single-family residences with minimum 20-foot rear setbacks balances General Plan policies that encourage compatible infill development (LU-4.2 and LU-4.3), and context-sensitive design (CD-5.2 and CD-5.3). The new public street would provide for future connectivity into under-developed adjacent areas, consistent with CIRC-2.2.1. The site is not located within a Neighborhood Plan or area plan.

2. **The proposed development, including the character, scale, and quality of design are consistent with the purpose/intent of this chapter and any adopted design guidelines.**

   The project design is consist with several Design Guidelines (DGs), including those that encourage a variety of home designs that include front porches and windows that face the street (DGs 4.1.11 and 4.1.14). The scale and character of the new homes is similar to and compatible with adjacent developments that predominantly includes single-story, single-family homes.

3. **The architectural design of structures, including all elevations, materials and colors are visually compatible with surrounding development. Design elements, including screening of equipment, exterior lighting, signs, and awnings, have been incorporated into the project to further ensure its compatibility with the character and uses of adjacent development.**

   The single-story residential designs and reserved color schemes are compatible with adjacent single-family residential developments. Exterior lighting would be typical of residential uses in the area, and the inclusion of a solid wall along part of the southerly boundary will minimize effects of the new development upon the existing horse ranch.

4. **The location and configuration of structures are compatible with their sites and with surrounding sites and structures, and do not unnecessarily block views from other structures or dominate their surroundings.**

   The combination of generous lot sizes, single-story construction, and minimum 20-foot rear setbacks will ensure that the new residences are compatible with their sites and surrounding uses, and that they will not unnecessarily block views or dominate their surroundings.

5. **The general landscape design, including the color, location, size, texture, type, and coverage of plant materials, and provisions for irrigation and maintenance, and protection of landscape elements, have been considered to ensure visual relief, to complement structures, and to provide an attractive environment.**
The proposed landscaping includes trees, shrubs, groundcover, and non-living elements that will provide adequate visual relief for the new residential area. Public improvements will include street trees planted at regular intervals to yield a tree-lined street in the future.

RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. All approved building plans, final maps and permits shall note that the project shall comply with The Crossroads Subdivision and Planned Development Permit (S/PDP 16-02). No building permits related to this approval shall be final without prior authorization of Planning staff.

2. Planned Development Permit 16-02 does not authorize any exceptions or deviations from Title 19 of the Chico Municipal Code. Future construction shall comply with all applicable requirements of Title 19.

3. All wall-mounted utilities and roof or wall penetrations, including vent stacks, utility boxes, exhaust vents, gas meters and associated equipment, shall be screened by appropriate materials and colors, illustrated or notated on the building plans as requiring screening, and subject to approval by Planning staff prior to issuance of a certificate of occupancy.

PUBLIC CONTACT

Public notice requirements are fulfilled by placing a notice on the project site and by posting of the agenda at least 10 days prior to the ARHPB meeting. In addition, staff emailed the notice on 01/09/17, to all interested parties who provided their email address on sign-in sheets at the neighborhood meetings.

ATTACHMENTS

A. Location Map
B. Applicant's Project Description
C. Subdivision Map
D. Open Space Exhibit
E. Color Elevations
F. Colors and Materials
G. Garage Door Examples
H. Lighting
I. Landscape Plan
J. Fencing Options
K. Applicant's List of Changes to the Project

DISTRIBUTION

Mike Sawley, Senior Planner
SCA Development Corp., Steve Honeycutt, 2550 Lakewest Drive, Suite 50, Chico, CA 95928
Rolls, Anderson & Rolls, Attn: Keith Doglio, 115 Yellowstone Drive, Chico, CA 95973
Joshua Leach, PO Box 4373, Chico, CA 95973
File: S/PDP 16-02
Project Description

The Crossroads Subdivision (S/PDP 16-02)

The proposal is to construct 13 single family residential lots on 3.57-acres, creating a net density of 3.64 units per acre. The new single family lots will street that will take access new residential street that will take access from Cactus Avenue and end in a cul-de-sac.

Lot Sizes:
Lots will range in size from 6,194 square feet to 14,692 square feet, with an average lot size of 8,490 square feet. Except for the linear frontage of Lot 4, all lots meet Chico Municipal Code development standards (frontage, depth and square footage requirements). Pursuant to Municipal Code section 18.44.020 design modifications can be requested when justified (See Design Modification Request, discussing in detail the street frontage width reduction).

Structures:
The homes are proposed to be single-story, which are at a mass and scale that does not dominate the surroundings, and are in line nearby residential neighborhoods. Thereby, meeting the design objective of chapter one of the Design Guideline manual and several guidelines (DG 1.2.11, 1.2.12 and 1.2.13).

The proposal creates interest and variety to the streetscape by introducing several dwelling designs, which will be customized by each home owner with the selection of body and trim colors, stone materials, roof color and lighting details. This will create a mix of designs throughout the subdivision (DG 4.2.15, 4.2.16 and 4.2.17). The homes contain front porches in a variety of sizes, which allows occupants to place patio furniture, potted landscaping and other ornamental elements near the entrance thereby making a positive connection to the street and a welcoming neighborhood. To minimize their appearance and have attractive street scape, garage doors will contain windows and painted to match the trim of the home (DG 1.2.31, 4.1.11, 4.1.12, 4.1.11 and 4.1.63).

The pallet incorporates an assortment of color and texture, which can be found in the existing neighborhood to the east, Wildwood Estates Subdivision (DG 1.1.11 and 4.2.22). A mixture of cultured stones brings added interest, and wrap around the end of the structures and terminate.

Lighting:
Structure lighting will be Wall Sconces, typically 11-inches tall, will be placed at the front of the garage and at the porch. Styling will include modern, mission, traditional and craftsman. Metal options will come in a variety of finishes including, black, white, bronze and distressed, with glass being either frosted, clear and seedy. Lights will be of wattages that provide for a safe environment, while creating an attractive night time street scape (DG 1.3.55 and DG 4.2.44). The intent is to allow each home owner to specify the style and design, which in turn bring added interest to the neighborhood without creating a sense of redundancy (DG 4.1.53).

Street lighting along Cactus Avenue will be of a candy-cane design, in compliance with the SD-7 overlay requirements to maintain a rural atmosphere of the area. Street lighting along the new streets will also be of the of the candy-cane design (City of Chico standard SL-1, page 7) to minimize any lighting on abutting properties.
Project Description
The Crossroads Subdivision (S/PDP 16-02)

Fencing:
To provide a physical barrier to the active horse ranch to the south, yet to still provide an active environment, fencing will be installed along the southern property line. A split-rail fence will be utilized from Cactus Avenue, and go approximately 345 feet to the west. The intent of this fence design is to not “wall in” the driveway to the south, nor the new street, but to provide design that maintains a rural atmosphere (DG 1.1.11, 1.1.12, DDG 1.2.13). From there, a solid fence will be installed along the remainder of the southern property line. This fence is designed to minimize interactions between the active horse ranch, and the single family residential area. The fence will be pre-cast concrete in design, with a finish and color that is to mimic wood and will be approximately 285 feet long.

Landscaping:
Future home owners will have the ability to customize their front yards, with individual landscapes chosen based upon owner’s taste and desires. Options will include details such as small stone walls, non-turf areas with chip bark and ground covering plants, trees and turf or a combination of. The intent of landscaping is similar to that of final home design, in which future home owners will have the ability to pick and choose the layout and design of the landscaped areas, which in turn will produce a verity along the street scape, with no two lots looking the same. All landscaping will be installed to AB 1881 water usage requirements, and all exposed areas will be installed with landscaping improvements.
LOT NOTES

1. Lot building pads shall conform to Chico municipal code standards.
2. Administrative modifications to shown building pads shall be permitted, including modifying driveway locations.
3. Lot coverage not to exceed Chico municipal standards.
4. Accessory structures and expansion of homes shall be permitted pursuant to Chico municipal code standards and permitting requirements.
5. The front door of Lot 13 shall face Cactus Avenue.
6. Each lot will have a minimum front yard area of 300 or 30,000 sq ft, excluding driveways, porches, and pathways.
7. Elevations are not to depict when similar floor plans are constructed next to each other. When the same floor plans are proposed next to each other, the front elevations will utilize different exterior materials, finishes, colors, and roof lines to create variety.

CROSSROADS SUBDIVISION
OPEN SPACE DISTRICT
FOR
SCA DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION

C A C T U S  A V E N U E
WILLOW ESTATES SUBDIVISION (PDP 05-15)

LEGEND
- SCA DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION
- SCA ESTATES PROPERTY
- SITE OF SCA-05-01
- PERSONAL PROPERTY LOCATION

PROPOSED LOT SIZE (SF) = 113,000
PROPOSED PAD AREA (SF) = 403,000
LOT AREA = PAD AREA (SF) = 370,000
3% OF LOT THAT IS NOT PAD = 3,430
The Crossroads Subdivision and Planned Development (S/PDP 16-02)

Garage Door Examples
The Crossroads Subdivision and Planned Development (S/PDP 16-02)

Structural Lighting Examples
THE CROSSROADS SUBDIVISION (S/PDP 16-02)
TYPICAL LANDSCAPE PLAN

Notes:
Planting and Installation Guidelines. All street trees and landscaping required within a public right-of-way or public service easement or on other city property shall be planted and installed in compliance with Chico Municipal Code section 18R.080.090 – Street trees and landscaping.

Water Efficient Standards. Projects with new landscape areas installed by a developer of 2,500 square feet or larger in size, and/or homeowner-installed landscapes of 5,000 square feet or larger in size, shall demonstrate compliance with state water efficiency standards pursuant to Chico Municipal Code section 19.68.070 – Water efficient landscaping standards.

Hydro-zone. Irrigation system will include in-line valves, quick couplers, and gate values. Planting will be organized into hydro-zones or similar water needs. New irrigation controllers will be Hunter, Rainbird, Irritrol or equal and will meet City of Chico’s Water Efficient Landscape Ordinance (WELO).

Soil Amendment. Contractor shall provide additional soil amendments including application volume and depth of compost amendment, and location, depth and type of surface mulch as appropriate to address adverse soil factors as directed by the City of Chico.

Homeowners. Homes will be landscaped from a palette of appropriate native and near native vegetation, trees and non-vegetative elements such as stacked fieldstone, cobble walls, and dry creek beds. Ground cover, bark and turf will be made available, with all landscaped areas receiving treatment. This landscape plan represents a typical plan, that can be modified by homeowners, subject to existing regulations and best practices.

PREPARED FOR:
SCA Development Corp. Attn: Steve Honeycutt
2550 Lakewest Drive, Suite 50, Chico, CA 95928

PREPARED BY:
Dugan's Landscape Installation and Maintenance
6281 Broyles Road, Chico, CA 95973
(530) 893-4548
Split Rail Examples:

Wall Examples:
Map Design Changes

The Crossroads Subdivision (S/PDP 16-02)

Revised 11/16/16

In response to the initial pre-application neighborhood meeting held on May 20, 2016, and planning staff’s comments, and subsequently the second pre-application neighborhood meeting held on August 20, 2016 the design of The Crossroads Subdivision (S/PDP 16-02) was examined and reevaluated by SCA Development to take into account opinions expressed by the neighbors and comments from City Staff.

Below are the major changes to the design that came out of both pre-application meetings and are now part of the project:

1. Road flip to southern side of property.
2. Total number of lots went down from 15 to 13, a 13 percent reduction in lots.
3. Net density went down from 4.2 to 3.64 units/per acre.
4. Average lot size went up from 7,900 square feet to 8,490 square feet.
5. Smallest lot went up from 5,451 square feet to 6,194 square feet.
6. Largest lot went up from 10,367 square feet to 14,692 square feet.
7. Lot 13, fronting on Cactus Avenue, has increased from 10,367 square feet to 12,738 square feet.
8. The 25-foot wide cross easement over two lots have been removed, and all lots front onto a street.
10. Self-imposed 20-foot rear yard setback on all lots.
11. Self-imposed 20-foot side yard setback on lots 1, 4 and 7.
12. Hammerhead turn-around design has been removed and cul-de-sac that meets standards is proposed.
13. All homes are designed to be single story.
14. New split-rail fence and wall will be placed along southern property line to minimize disturbance to existing breeding mares and property owners to the south, while maintaining a rural feel.